

Implementation of Audit Recommendations – Quarterly Updates

2015 Qtr 1 to 2021 Qtr 4

Reports received by Council are found at: winnipeg.ca/dmis



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2015 – Quarter 1*

Leaders in building public trust in civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	5
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?	5
Status of Audit Recommendations	6
1 st Quarter 2015 Commitments	7
Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 1	8
Audit Observations	12

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report. In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report. After five years, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

**Status of Audit Recommendations
2015 Quarter 1**

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Percent Complete	Not to be implemented	2 nd Qtr 2015	3 rd Qtr 2015	4 th Qtr 2015 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	67%	2				
	23	21	91%			2		
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit, 2009	6	4	67%				2	
Local Improvements Audit, 2010	9	7	78%				2	
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	74%	1			4	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	23	85%	2			2	
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	77%	1			2	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	6	67%	1	1		1	
Contract with Winnipeg Airports Authority, 2012	13	13	100%					
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	1	11%				8	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	87%	1			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10	92%			2		
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013 *	7	6	86%				1	
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014 *	13	9	69%		1		3	
TOTAL	181	141	78%	8	2	4	26	0

* First QRC Update

1st Quarter 2015 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	1 st Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Review of Winnipeg Public Library Services	Rec #2	-	Rec #2	2015 Qtr 2
Contract with Winnipeg Airports Authority	Rec #1	Rec # 1		
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit	Rec #2	-	Rec #2	2015 Qtr 3
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	3	1		

This table summarizes the status of the 3 recommendations targeted for review in the 1st Quarter of 2015, including new target dates for implementation.

UPDATE – WPS Civilianization Audit

The Winnipeg Police Service has indicated that they will no longer be supplying updates on the implementation status of recommendations proposed in the *WPS Civilianization Audit*. As at December 31, 2014, the WPS noted that 3 out of the 7 recommendations were implemented.

The WPS has indicated the following progress to date:

- A civilianization strategy to identify sworn officer positions for possible conversion as outlined in Recommendation #2 has been completed.
- A strategy has been adopted for Recommendation #3 – *undertake a work load analysis to determine the optimal number of civilian staff to deliver the desired level of service.*
- Also a strategy has been adopted for Recommendation #4 – *establish a performance management system*

WPS management has noted that the new WPS Strategic Plan identifies civilianization as a priority for the Service. Within the plan, a reporting mechanism will ensure action items are progressing. With the implementation of the new Strategic Plan the WPS will shift the reporting on these matters to the Police Board.

The Director of the Police Board has communicated that the Board will be monitoring implementation and will require satisfactory evidence of implementation in accordance with good governance practices.

The Audit Department will no longer include the status of audit recommendations for the *WPS Civilianization Audit*.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 1

Capital Projects Management, 2009	
# 21	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects in consultation with the departments responsible for administering the City's capital projects update the project management manual by deleting outdated procedures, while at the same time identifying gaps or internal inconsistencies in procedures which should be filled or corrected. (See Review of Capital Project Procedures and Practices against PMBOK® sections for specific recommendation # 23 on changes to the content of the manual.)</p> <p>The Manager of Capital Projects should ensure that the body of capital project procedures is codified to enable the production of a comprehensive index of those procedures for easy identification and access.</p> <p>The Manager of Capital Projects should develop and maintain a "Procedure Control" system which will enable him to periodically conduct reviews, updates and re-alignment of procedures as needed and necessary. The Manager of Capital Projects should establish document control and retention procedures for capital projects.</p>
# 23a	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • project scope planning, scope definition, work breakdown structure (relative to scope definition), scope verification and scope control. These procedures should be aligned with the administrative directives governing capital projects and with bid opportunity documents and contracts.
# 23b	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • project schedule management and control processes. The existing procedures should be updated to reflect contemporary scheduling methodology. These procedures should be aligned with corporate project schedule management and control procedures and procurement documents.
# 23c	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to provide guidance pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • project estimates by both the departments and its contractors and consultants. This guidance should be based on current industry standards for the preparation of capital construction estimates and be consistent with administrative directives governing cost management and control.
# 23d	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • quality control and quality assurance.
# 23e	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • project management staffing from a function and process perspective.
# 23f	<p>We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • project communications that reflect currently accepted capital construction industry standards for progress reporting. The Administrative Directive FM-004 and project manual should be amended to include a section dealing with the responsibilities of the project manager to ensure that the Contract Administrator/Construction Manager provides the required periodic project progress and performance reports.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 1

Capital Projects Management, 2009	
# 23g	We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • capital project risk management for departments and project managers.
# 23h	We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • closure of capital construction projects which are linked to specific actions within specific time constraints.
# 23i	We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should oversee the revisions to the Draft Manual of Project Administration Practice to establish procedures pertaining to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • an execution plan. The format of the execution plan should be developed with assistance and input of project managers representing each of the departments and a cross section of project types. An execution plan should be required for all capital projects.
# 24	We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should examine project delivery methodologies in practice by public sector entities around the world to ascertain which of those methodologies might be beneficially adopted by the City for its particular project composition and inventory. The CFO and the Manager of Capital Projects should amend Administrative Directive FM-004 to include guidance on the selection of a project delivery methodology which will be a fit with the project conditions, goals and objectives. The Manager of Capital Projects needs to establish clear criteria for the selection of a capital project delivery system that is best suited for a particular project. The current procurement procedures promulgated by Materials Management and the contract templates used for capital projects would need to be expanded and/or modified to support the particular systems and methodologies adopted. Contract templates for Design Build and other project delivery methodologies need to be developed to support the choice of appropriate project delivery methods.
# 26	We recommend that the CFO working with the City Solicitor should clarify the City's position on what management and control processes can be ceded to a third party, the role of the owner's project management team in those instances where allocation of management and control has been made to a third party and, finally, the correct alignment of those management and control allocations with the provisions of the contract document set.

Contract with Winnipeg Airports Authority, 2012	
# 1	We recommend that the Materials Management Division work with the CAO to clarify the wording of the Materials Management Policy and prepare a report for the consideration of Council.

Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	
# 7	Conduct a comprehensive review of lighting requirements for all pools and adjacent areas. All areas of the pool, deck and adjacent areas are required to be illuminated by a minimum of 200 Lux of lighting, including evening hours of operation. At the time of the pool inspections, lighting levels varied significantly throughout the facility (140-240 lux). Lighting levels must be maintained at this level so that lifeguards and instructors have sufficient light to monitor all areas of the swimming pool. Multiple facilities were noted as being non-compliant with this recommendation; refer to Table 1 for a listing.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 1

Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	
# 1	Director of CSS should ensure Administrative Standard HR-010 is re-communicated to all organization and departmental leaders with emphasis on the respective roles and responsibilities and further defining the expectations for oversight.
# 3	Director of CSS should ensure the Organizational Safety and Occupational Hygiene Branch perform the expanded oversight responsibilities as defined in Administrative Standard HR-010.
# 4	Director of CSS to require regular reporting of safety performance information by the departmental human resource leaders to the Organizational Safety Branch. Departmental human resource leaders should work with departmental safety resources, where applicable, and their Department Heads to ensure organizational safety initiatives are implemented and performance information reported to demonstrate the departments' compliance with the Workplace Safety and Health Act.
# 5	Director of CSS ensure that the Organizational Safety Code of Practice be updated to include the above noted safety responsibilities for a supervisor and communicated throughout the organization.
# 6	The Organizational Safety Code of Practice should be amended to include departmental and organizational safety resources as contacts for escalating a safety concern.
# 7	Director of CSS, with input from the users of the performance information, should establish minimum standards for the type of information to be collected and reported, guidance to ensure data integrity and mechanisms to ensure the right staff receive the right information at the right interval. This will allow the departments and the organization to proactively manage the performance and cost of the safety programs throughout the City.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 1

311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	
# 1	311 Management should aggregate the quality evaluation of CSR calls to create a series of performance metrics that would provide information on the level of quality achieved by the organization and to monitor and report on those metrics to ensure the level of quality is maintained or improved.
# 4	We recommend 311 Management continue to review scripts to ensure all are in compliance with FIPPA.
# 5	We recommend that the 311 Contact Centre use the City performance evaluation framework to formally document the performance evaluation of all staff, including senior staff.
# 6	We recommend that Contact Centre management continue to work with their own staff and departments to further refine processes to identify and group multiple service requests.
# 7	We recommend that the Contact Centre periodically test the application to ensure that the recording functionality is operating as intended.
# 8	We recommend that electronic forms contain data validation controls to reduce the potential for errors and that they are reviewed to ensure that mandatory fields are functioning as required.
# 10	We recommend management identify, analyze and report on key efficiency measures, enhance reporting on some effectiveness measures and benchmark against industry standards to assess performance of the 311 Contact Centre. Considerations should be given to publishing the information on their website quarterly.
# 11	We recommend Contact Centre management continue to implement and further develop their high level analysis of flow-backs that can identify trends in relation to individuals, departments and types of errors.
# 12	We recommend management revise the complaint status report to include the following information at a minimum: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o classification of the complaints by type o only one instance for each complaint (currently there are multiple instances for each complaint (typically 3) which represents each time there was action taken on the file (i.e. transfer, resolve) o Fields that indicates whether the complaint has been resolved, by whom, and/or the nature of the resolution, if the complainant has been notified (explanation if not), expanded details about the complaint and what specifically was done to address the issue.

Audit Observations

21 recommendations have been implemented in the 1st Quarter of 2015

- 4 recommendations from Capital Projects Management
- 1 recommendation from Contract with Winnipeg Airports Authority
- 1 recommendation from Safety Review of Aquatics Services
- 6 recommendations from Workplace Safety Audit
- 9 recommendations from 311 Contact Centre Audit

The Public Service has reported that all 13 recommendations have been implemented for the *Contract with Winnipeg Airports Authority*.

As at March 31, 2015, 141 of the 181 (78%) contained in this Report Card have been implemented and there are 32 recommendations in progress.

Recommendation #2 from the *Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services* missed the 1st quarter 2015 target date and is now scheduled to be implemented next quarter. Recommendation #2 from *the Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit* it also missed the 1st quarter 2015 target date and is now scheduled for implementation in the 3rd quarter of 2015.

The Public Service has reported that 2 of the 32 recommendations in progress should be implemented by June 30, 2015. The status of these 2 recommendations will be the focus of our next report card.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2015 – Quarter 2*

Leaders in building public trust in civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?.....	5
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?	5
Status of Audit Recommendations	6
2 nd Quarter 2015 Commitments.....	7
Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 2	7
Audit Observations.....	8

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report. In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report. After five years, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Status of Audit Recommendations 2015 Quarter 2

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Percent Complete	Not to be implemented	3 rd Qtr 2015	4 th Qtr 2015	1 st Qtr 2016 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	67%	2				
	23	21	96%		1		1	
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit, 2009	6	4	67%			2		
Local Improvements Audit, 2010	9	8	89%			1		
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	74%	1		2	2	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	23	85%	2		2		
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	77%	1		2		
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	78%	1		1		
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	1	11%			8		
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	87%	1			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10	92%		2			
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	7	6	86%				1	
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	9	69%		1	3		
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014 *	6	4	67%		1		1	
TOTAL	174	134	77%	8	5	21	6	0

* First QRC Update

2nd Quarter 2015 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	2 nd Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Review of Winnipeg Public Library Services	1	1	-	-
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	1	1		

This table summarizes the status of the one recommendation targeted for review in the 2nd Quarter of 2015. The recommendation has been implemented.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 2

Local Improvements Audit, 2010	
# 3	We recommend that Assessment & Taxation Department develop an amendment to the Local Improvement Regulation By-Law to include notification of the next Community Committee meeting in all the letters of notice to property owners as defined in section 409(3) of the Charter.

Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	
# 2	The Library Services Division develop a business plan that identifies a set of goals and related strategies to be accomplished within a defined timeframe and supported by performance measures to enable evaluation of achievement. The goals should be prioritized and the needs in each community along with the overall purpose of the library should be considered when developing the business plan.

Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	
# 1	We recommend that the Infrastructure Planning Division of the Corporate Finance Department review and update Appendix 2 to the Capital Budget to reflect the City's actual experience for capital projects.
# 2	We recommend that the Financial Planning and Review Division of the Corporate Finance Department ensure that the specific estimate class for each project is clearly disclosed in the Capital Budget.
# 3	We recommend that the Engineering Division of the Public Works Department develop and document a methodology for budgeting engineering overhead for major capital projects.
# 6	We recommend that the Public Works Department integrate the processes embedded in the City's Investment Planning Manual and Project Management Manual into its capital project management processes once the manuals have been formally adopted by the Public Service.

Audit Observations

6 recommendations have been implemented in the 2nd Quarter of 2015

- 1 recommendation from Local Improvements Audit
- 1 recommendation from Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services
- 4 recommendations from Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit

As at June 30, 2015, 134 of the 174 (77%) contained in this Report Card have been implemented and there are 32 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 5 of the 32 recommendations in progress should be implemented by September 30, 2015. The status of these 5 recommendations will be the focus of our next report card.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2015 – Quarter 3*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	5
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?	5
Status of Audit Recommendations	6
3 rd Quarter 2015 Commitments.....	7
Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 3.....	7
Audit Observations	8

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report. In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report. After five years, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

**Status of Audit Recommendations
2015 Quarter 3**

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Percent Complete	Not to be implemented	4 th Qtr 2015	1 st Qtr 2016	2 nd Qtr 2016 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	67%	2				
	23	21	96%		1		1	
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit, 2009	6	4	67%				2	
Local Improvements Audit, 2010	9	9	100%					
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	74%	1			4	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	23	85%	2	2			
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	77%	1	2			
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	78%	1	1			
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	1	11%		8			
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	87%	1			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10	92%				2	
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	7	6	86%			1		
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	9	69%		4			
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5	83%				1	
TOTAL	174	136	78%	8	18	1	11	0

3rd Quarter 2015 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	3 rd Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Capital Projects Management, 2009	1	-	#25	2015 Qtr 4
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	-	#2, #6	2016 Qtr 2
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1	-	#2	2015 Qtr 4
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1	1	-	-
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	5	1		

This table summarizes the status of the five recommendations targeted for review in the 3rd Quarter of 2015.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 3

Local Improvements Audit, 2010	
# 1	We recommend that the Assessment and Taxation Department work with the Public Works Department to recommend to Council that the Local Improvement Regulation By-law be amended so that the method of calculation for rates charged for lighting services be the same as those charged for other above-ground works.

Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	
# 4	We recommend that the Infrastructure Planning Division of the Corporate Finance Department reassess the threshold defining a "Major Capital Project" for capital project management processes under the CAO's delegated authority; and that it also submit the proposed threshold to Council for approval for processes under Council's authority.

Audit Observations

Two recommendations have been implemented in the 3rd Quarter of 2015:

- One recommendation from Local Improvements Audit – All recommendations from this project have been implemented.
- One recommendation from Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit

As at September 30, 2015, 136 of the 174 (78%) contained in this Report Card have been implemented and there are 30 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 18 of the 30 recommendations in progress should be implemented by December 31, 2015. The status of these 18 recommendations will be the focus of our next report card.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2015 – Quarter 4*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?	1
Status of Audit Recommendations	2
4 th Quarter 2015 Commitments	3
Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 4	3
Audit Observations	4

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2015 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report.

In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Status of Audit Recommendations
2015 Quarter 4

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete	1 st Qtr 2016	2 nd Qtr 2016	3 rd Qtr 2016 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2					
	23	22		96%			1	
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit, 2009	6	4		67%			2	
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	1	79%		2	2	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	23	2	93%		2		
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	1	85%			2	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%			1	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%		1	4	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10		92%		2		
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	7	6		86%	1			
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	11		85%	1	1		
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%			1	
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	2		33%			4	
TOTAL	171	135	8	79%	2	8	18	0

4th Quarter 2015 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	4 th Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Capital Projects Management, 2009	1	1	-	-
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	2	-	#1, #8	2016 Qtr 2
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	2	-	#1, #3	2016 Qtr 3 or later
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	1	-	#1	2016 Qtr 3 or later
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	8	3	#6 #2, #4, #5, #9	2016 Qtr 2 2016 Qtr 3 or later
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	4	2	#3 #13	2016 Qtr 1 2016 Qtr 2
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	18	6		

This table summarizes the status of the eighteen recommendations targeted for review in the 4th Quarter of 2015.

Recommendations Implemented 2015 Qtr 4

Capital Projects Management, 2009

#25 We recommend that the CFO in consultation with the Directors of Water & Waste, Public Works, PP&D and the City Solicitor should examine the City's current agency practices insofar as the selection of a Contract Administrator. There are alternatives to the City's current practice which may reduce the City's risk of claims and disputes while improving the overall management and control of project planning and execution.

311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014

#2 We recommend 311 Contact Centre management develop a report for consideration of Council to revisit the performance target of 80% of calls answered within 30 seconds with a mind to revising it to a more realistic target consistent with what the City can afford. The revised target should consider exploring areas where service efficiencies can be gained through the expanded use of IVR and modifications to the hours of operations.

#9 We recommend that management include the Information Technology related costs when reporting on the total costs of providing the 311 service.

Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012

- #3 We recommend that management communicate to staff the importance of accurately reporting actual hours worked by contractors to ensure transparency over the use of public funds and that only trained and qualified individuals have the responsibility of signing off on work tickets and that a listing of these individuals is maintained and monitored.
- #7 We recommend that management improve documentation of the reviews and to create a procedure to ensure that all reviews take place prior to a transaction being processed for payment.
- #8 We recommend that management review the necessity for including the overtime premium and age adjustment conditions in the Bid Opportunity with respect to obtaining the best value for the City.

Audit Observations

Six recommendations have been implemented in the 4th Quarter of 2015.

As at December 31, 2015, 135 of the 171 (79%) contained in this Report Card have been completed and there are 28 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 2 of the 28 recommendations in progress should be implemented by March 31, 2016. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2016 – Quarter 1*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
Status of Audit Recommendations	2
Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 1	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 1	4
Audit Observations.....	4
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit (2009) - Final Status Report	5

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report.

In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Status of Audit Recommendations
2016 Quarter 1

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete	2 nd Qtr 2016	3 rd Qtr 2016	4 th Qtr 2016 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2					
	23	22		96%			1	
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	1	79%	2	2		
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%			1	
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	1	85%			2	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%		1		
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%			5	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10		83%		1	1	
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	7	6		86%	1			
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%	1			
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%			1	
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	3	1	67%			2	
TOTAL	165	134	9	81%	4	4	14	

1st Quarter 2016 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	1 st Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	1	-	#2	2016 Qtr 2
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1	1	-	-
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	2	1		

This table summarizes the status of the two recommendations targeted for review in the 1st Quarter of 2016.

Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 1

311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014

- #3 We recommend that the 311 Contact Centre work with departments to establish formal Service Level Agreements which would include the following:
- o The responsibilities of each party
 - o The level of service required by each party
 - o How costs are charged back to the Department or SOA
 - o Dispute resolution procedures
 - o Access, roles, and responsibilities related to departmental data and systems

Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit

- #3 We recommend that the Community By-law Enforcement Division review the Public Performance Reporting Principles issued by the Canadian Comprehensive Auditing Foundation for guidance in potential further improvements in its public performance reports.

Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority

- #8 It is recommended that the WPA conduct full condition appraisals for all city-owned surface parking lots.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 1

Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit

#6 We recommend that the Community By-law Enforcement Division continue to explore the deployment of tablet technology by analyzing the extra capacity in service that employing tablets can achieve.

The recommendation is now identified to not be implemented. The Division is currently focusing on other capital requirements recommended in the audit. Mobile technology will be given consideration for future capital requests. A Corporate Enterprise Content Management initiative is ongoing, mobile technology will be re-evaluated based on the outcome of this project.

Audit Observations

Two recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 1st Quarter of 2016 and one recommendation was implemented. An additional two recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule and one recommendation is now identified to not be implemented.

The number of audit reports changed slightly from thirteen to twelve, as the Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit was removed from the quarterly report card listing and a final status report is provided.

As at March 31, 2016, 134 of the 165 recommendations (81%) contained in this Report Card have been completed and there are 22 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 4 of the 22 recommendations in progress should be implemented by June 30, 2016. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit (2009) - Final Status Report

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report and extended as circumstances warrant. This quarter, the Audit Department is providing a final status report on the Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. Included is a summary of all recommendations, the date of implementation and a final management status update relating to the two recommendations in progress.

Status of Recommendations as at March 31, 2016

AUDIT REPORT	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Not to be implemented	Percent Complete	2 nd Qtr 2016	3 rd Qtr 2016	4 th Qtr 2016	1 st Qtr 2017 or later
Building Permits and Inspections Service Audit	6	4	-	89%	-	-	2	-

No.	Recommendation	Status
1.	The Division should re-evaluate its current practices and procedures and move to a more risk-based plan examination and inspection methodology. In the short term, a methodology similar to that proposed for the Certified Builder Program in that the Division will be able to rely on the inspection work of Certified Builders but will still maintain a risk-based audit function of the work that is relied on. In the longer term, the Division should continue to work towards fully implementing the Certified Professional Program.	Implemented 2012 Qtr 1
1.a.	The Division should continue to reevaluate the building activities that require permits with a mind in reducing and eliminating the requirements for building activities that are considered to be low risk.	Implemented 2012 Qtr 1

No.	Recommendation	Status
1.b.	The Division should analyze the backlog of residential permits to better assess the risk posed by leaving these permits open. Steps should be taken to implement formal processes for closing permits that pose a minimal or low safety risk or where the permit is open beyond the term of the permit (i.e., six months unless original term has been extended by the Division).	<p><u>Final Management Status Update:</u></p> <p>The resolution of this recommendation has involved a complete analysis of the residential permit backlog, and closure of identified aged permits which has been completed. The formal procedure to preventing a back log has been researched and a plan has been developed. The procedure is a multipronged approach which includes: additional resources for all aspects of the permit process, working collaboratively with industry, an innovative fee structure that provides financial incentive to close permits within the appropriate time frame and improved customer service through an automated notification system which will provide courtesy email reminders to ensure the timelines are adhered to. The components of this initiative will be on-going and part of a continual process improvement plan which will also include regular benchmarking measures.</p> <p>This will be fully implemented by Q4 2016.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Status
2.	We recommend that the Division develop enforcement guidelines that provide decision criteria with respect to the utilization of various enforcement mechanisms. The enforcement guidelines should also clearly outline the parameters where the inspectors have authority to use judgment.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 1
2.a.	We recommend that the Division establish formal procedures for follow-up in situations where there are known violations or where permits are approaching the end of their term (i.e., six months unless original term has been extended by the Division). Priority should be given to developing these procedures in the Housing/Existing Buildings Branch.	<p><u>Final Management Status Update:</u></p> <p>Formal procedures have been developed and will be implemented as part of the June 1st 2016 change in fee structure which includes financial incentives to close permits within the appropriate time frame and financial penalties if failure to follow up on known violations/or completion within the designated time frame. Customer service will be enhanced with increased communication through an automated notification system which will provide courtesy email reminders.</p> <p>This will be fully implemented by Q4 2016.</p>
2.b.	We recommend that the Division formally track and report on its enforcement activities, which include the number of violation notices verbal and written, stop work orders, and the number of monetary penalties assessed.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 2

No.	Recommendation	Status
3.	PP&D should complete a full costing of services (i.e., residential permits, non-residential permits, occupancy permits, etc.), which includes the costs incurred by Public Works and Water and Waste in delivering the service.	Implemented 2011 Qtr 1
3.a.	Once the full costs of providing these services are known, PP&D should review the fee structure and recommend to Council any policy changes that may be required regarding the setting of Building Fees.	Implemented 2011 Qtr 1
3.b.	PP&D needs to establish a process for capturing and compiling detailed costing information of the Development Approvals, Building Permits and Inspections Service which is inclusive of all departments that assist in providing the service. The total cost to deliver the service needs to be transparent to enable the Department to support the fees charged to provide the service.	Implemented 2011 Qtr 1
3.c.	The Fund manager should ensure that the use of Permit Reserve Fund is restricted to stabilizing development and building fees and to support the delivery of the Development Approvals, Building Permits and Inspections Service. Any excess reserve funds should be used to make service improvements or to allow for a reduction in fees.	Implemented 2010 Qtr 4

No.	Recommendation	Status
4.	We recommend the Division review their service delivery strategy and determine the level of service they want to provide and adjust the staffing levels accordingly to be able to provide the determined level of service. If staffing levels cannot be adjusted, processes and strategy of the Division should be amended to adjust to the level of service that can be offered with the available staff resources.	Implemented 2012 Qtr 3
4.a.	We recommend the Division develop a succession plan to deal with the significant number of retirements expected in the near future. A strategy to effectively retain and recruit the employees with the necessary skills should be given priority.	Implemented 2012 Qtr 3
4.b.	The Division should take the necessary measures to improve the work environment within the Division to ensure they are a workplace of choice. Some of these measures would include ensuring the City's total compensation package is competitive and ensuring a healthy work life balance.	Implemented 2012 Qtr 3
4.c.	The Division should develop training manuals and guidance to prevent the loss of business knowledge that could be lost with the retirement of staff.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 2
4.d.	We recommend supervision policies and procedures be established by the branch and division management. The role of every position in a supervisory function should be reviewed to ensure adequate time is allocated to effectively perform the supervisory duties. Division management should ensure this function is being carried out.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 4

No.	Recommendation	Status
5.	We recommend that the Division use Amanda for commercial inspections and that the necessary resources be allocated to accomplish this in a timely manner.	Implemented 2010 Qtr 2

No.	Recommendation	Status
6.	We recommend that the Division establish measurable performance goals and service standards. These performance goals and service standards should be established to be used to evaluate the performance at the Service, Division, Branch and staff level. The service standards should also be communicated to the customer.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 4
6.a.	We recommend that the Division establish processes to track and review available performance information in order to improve the efficiencies and effectiveness of the Division and contribute to the decision making process.	Implemented 2013 Qtr 4
6.b.	We recommend that the Division establish formal processes to report to Department management on a monthly, quarterly or annual basis regarding the Division's performance with respect to the established performance goals and service standards for the permits and inspections processes and services. The performance information and the frequency of reporting should be tailored to each level of management.	Implemented 2011 Qtr 4



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2016 – Quarter 2*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
Status of Audit Recommendations	2
Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 2	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 2	3
Audit Observations.....	4

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report.

In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Status of Audit Recommendations
2016 Quarter 2

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete	3 rd Qtr 2016	4 th Qtr 2016	1 st Qtr 2017 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2					
	23	22		96%		1		
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	1	79%		1	3	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%			1	
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	1	85%			2	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%			1	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%		4	1	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	10		83%	1	1		
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	7	7		100%				
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%	1			
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%			1	
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	3	1	67%		1	1	
TOTAL	165	135	9	82%	2	8	11	

2nd Quarter 2016 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	2 nd Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	2	-	#14, #6	2016 Qtr 4, 2017 Qtr 2
Workplace Safety Audit, 2013	1	1	#2	-
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1	-	#13	2016 Qtr 3
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	4	1		

This table summarizes the status of the four recommendations targeted for review in the 2nd Quarter of 2016.

Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 2

Workplace Safety Audit, 2013

- #2 Director of Corporate Support Services establish a more comprehensive set of minimum safety standards for the organizational safety program to be implemented in all departments to monitor compliance with the Workplace Safety and Health Act.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 2

None

Audit Observations

Four recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 2nd Quarter of 2016 and one recommendation was implemented.

As at June 30, 2016, 135 of the 165 recommendations (82%) contained in this Report Card have been completed and there are 21 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 2 of the 21 recommendations in progress should be implemented by September 30, 2016. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2016 – Quarter 3*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
Status of Audit Recommendations	2
Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 3 *	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 3	4
Audit Observations.....	4

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service. The Audit Department has traditionally provided Audit Committee with an update on the status of the implementation of outstanding audit recommendations in its annual report.

In 2006, the *Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card* was introduced at the request of Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented at the next Audit Committee. The *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed by the Audit Department to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendation. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. The Audit Department summarizes the results and prepares a brief overview for Audit Committee. We review the supporting documentation to confirm that recommendations have been implemented. The completed *Quarterly Report Card* is presented to Audit Committee by the City Auditor along with any observations he may have.

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Status of Audit Recommendations
2016 Quarter 3

AUDIT REPORTS	RECOMMENDATIONS				TARGET DATE FOR COMPLETION			
	Total	Complete	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete	4 th Qtr 2016	1 st Qtr 2017	2 nd Qtr 2017 or later	Target Date Unknown
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2					
	23	22		96%	1			
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	1	79%	1		3	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%			1	
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	1	85%			2	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%			1	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%	4		1	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%			1	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%			1	
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%	1			
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%			1	
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	3	1	67%		1	1	
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2016	15	4		27%			11	
TOTAL	173	133	9	83%	7	1	23	

3rd Quarter 2016 Commitments

AUDIT REPORTS	3 rd Qtr Target for Implementation	Complete	NEW TARGET	
			Recommendation	Date
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1	1	#6	-
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1	-	#13	2016 Qtr 4
TOTAL Number of Recommendations	2	1		

This table summarizes the status of the two recommendations targeted for review in the 3rd Quarter of 2016.

Recommendations Implemented 2016 Qtr 3 *

Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013

- #6 We recommend that the Manager of Real Estate work with the Director of PP&D to prepare a report for the consideration of Council making delegated authority usage reporting for WHHI transactions an annual requirement, report the usage in the annual report of non-monetary real estate grants, and document the process in the Division's policies and procedures manual, conditional upon Council's reissuance of the delegated authority.

Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2016

- #4 We recommend that the Director of EMSB, in consultation with the WFPS Manager of Finance, reinstate annual inventory counts at the Branch.
Risk assessment – Medium
- #6 We recommend that the Mechanic job description be updated to include the requirement for EVT certification upon recruitment, or the pursuit and achievement thereof within a specified timeframe.
Risk assessment - Medium
- #7 We recommend that the Director of EMSB job description be updated to clarify the minimum management and administration education required to qualify for the position, and what the acceptable equivalency for the education would be.
Risk assessment - High
- #8 We recommend that the Winnipeg Fire Paramedics Service create a job description for the Supervisor of EMSB position.
Risk assessment – Medium

* Some of these recommendations were implemented prior to Q3 2016; however this is the first formal follow-up on the Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented 2016 Qtr 3

None

Audit Observations

Two recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 3rd Quarter of 2016 and one recommendation was implemented.

As at September 30, 2016, 133 of the 173 recommendations (82%) contained in this Report Card have been completed and there are 31 recommendations in progress.

The Public Service has reported that 7 of the 31 recommendations in progress should be implemented by December 31, 2016. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

October, 2016



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2016 – Quarter 4*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2016 Qtr 4	2
Recommendations Completed in 2016 Qtr 4.....	2
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2016 Qtr 4	2
Recommendations in Progress as at 2016 Qtr 4	3
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	4

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2016 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2016 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Capital Projects Management, 2009	28	2 nd Qtr 2017
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	14	1 st Qtr 2017
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	2	4 th Qtr 2017
	5	4 th Qtr 2017
	6	4 th Qtr 2017
	9	4 th Qtr 2017
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	2 nd Qtr 2017
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit	1	-

Eight recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 4th Quarter of 2016 and one of the targeted recommendations was implemented.

Recommendations Completed in 2016 Qtr 4

Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit

Rec #1 We recommend that the Community By-law Enforcement Services Division further refine the performance measurement system by creating outcome measures and targets relating to intended outcomes for community group partnerships.

Risk Area: Information Resources

Risk Assessment: Moderate

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2016 Qtr 4

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2016 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Complete	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				1 st Qtr 2017	2 nd Qtr 2017	3 rd Qtr 2017 or later
Capital Projects Management, 2009	1, 2, 4, 5, 6	3	-			
	7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29	13	28		28	
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10, 14	14	6	9, 10
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27	9, 13	1		1	
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13	2	1, 3			1, 3
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1		1	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9			2, 4, 5, 6, 9
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15	12	8			8
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2			2
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	13		13	
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			5
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5			5
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	4, 6, 7, 8	-	1, 2, 3, 5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15		11, 13, 14	1, 2, 3, 5, 9, 10, 12, 15
TOTAL			30	1	8	21

The Public Service has reported that one of the 30 recommendations in progress should be implemented by March 31, 2017. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Complete	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2	
	23	22		96%
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	14	1	79%
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	10	1	85%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	4		27%
TOTAL	173	134	9	83%

As at December 31, 2016, 134 of the 173 recommendations (83%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2017 – Quarter 1*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 1	2
Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 1.....	2
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 1	2
Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 1	3
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	4

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Traffic Signals Performance Branch Audit	14	-

One recommendation was targeted for implementation and was implemented in the 1st Quarter of 2017. An additional recommendation was implemented ahead of schedule. One recommendation was determined not to be implemented.

Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 1

Traffic Signals Performance Branch Audit

Rec #14 Traffic Signals Branch management should develop a formalized signal timing review process. Resources should be reviewed to ensure adequate staffing either internally or externally exists to implement the program.

Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit

Rec #1 We recommend that the Agency establish a comprehensive performance measurement system that provides understandable, reliable, timely, and goal-oriented information on the performance of the enforcement function in relation to the Agency's goals, and set operational targets for these measures.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 1

Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit

Rec #3 We recommend that the Agency develop a system for reporting on actual response times in comparison to service standards, track the number of incidents where resources are required, and set operational targets for these metrics.

City Auditor Comment – The implemented software solution does not provide the functionality to track the various stages of response times (call received, call attended, closed). Animal Services staff may attend some sites multiple times before an incident is closed thereby diminishing the integrity of an actual response time to service standard comparison.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Complete	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				2 nd Qtr 2017	3 rd Qtr 2017	4 th Qtr 2017 or later
Capital Projects Management, 2009	1, 2, 4, 5, 6	3	-			
	7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29	13	28			28
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10		6	9, 10
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27	9, 13	1			1
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13	2, 3	-			
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1			1
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9			2, 4, 5, 6, 9
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15	12	8			8
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2		
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	13	13		
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			5
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5			5
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	4, 6, 7, 8	-	1, 2, 3, 5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	1, 3, 11, 15	5, 9, 10, 12, 13	2, 14
TOTAL			27	6	6	15

The Public Service has reported that six of the 27 recommendations in progress should be implemented by June 30, 2017. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Complete	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Capital Projects Management, 2009	6	4	2	
	23	22		96%
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%
Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit, 2011	13	11	2	100% *
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	4		27%
TOTAL	173	136	10	84%

As at March 31, 2017, 136 of the 173 recommendations (84%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.

* All of the recommendations from the Animal Services By-law Enforcement Audit have now been addressed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2017 – Quarter 2*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 2	2
Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 2.....	2
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 2.....	2
Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 2	3
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	4

Status of Audit Recommendations Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 2

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit	2	3 rd Qtr 2017
311 Contact Centre Audit	13	4 th Qtr 2017
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit	1	4 th Qtr 2017
	3	4 th Qtr 2017
	11	3 rd Qtr 2017
	15	implemented

Six recommendations were targeted for implementation and one was implemented in the 2nd Quarter of 2017. One additional recommendation was implemented ahead of schedule.

Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 2

Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit

Rec #15 We recommend that the Director of Emergency Mechanical Services Branch document a formal risk management plan.

Capital Project Management Audit

Rec #28 We recommend that the Manager of Capital Projects should consider the use of Short-form Bidding and Contracting, Project Bundling and Multi-year awards for routine, repetitive projects (such as street renewal projects).

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 2

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 2

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				3 rd Qtr 2017	4 th Qtr 2017	1 st Qtr 2018 or later
Capital Projects Management, 2009	1, 2, 4, 5, 6	3	-			
	7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29	13	-			
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	6	9, 10	
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27	9, 13	1		1	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1			1
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9		2, 4, 5, 6, 9	
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15	12	8		8	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2		
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	13		13	
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5			5
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	4, 6, 7, 8, 15	-	1, 2, 3, 5, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14	9, 10, 11, 12	1, 2, 3, 5, 13, 14	
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1		-	1	1		
TOTAL			26	7	16	2

The Public Service has reported that seven of the 26 recommendations in progress should be implemented by September 30, 2017. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Capital Projects Management, 2009 *	6	4	2	
	23	23		100%
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	15	13	1	93%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	5		33%
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1	1	-		0%
TOTAL	161	127	8	83%

As at June 30, 2017, 135 of the 161 recommendations (83%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.

* All of the recommendations from the Capital Projects Management Audit have now been addressed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2017 – Quarter 3*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 3	2
Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 3.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 3	3
Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 3	4
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	5

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 3

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit	2	4 th Qtr 2017
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit	6	1 st Qtr 2018
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit	9	4 th Qtr 2017
	10	4 th Qtr 2017
	11	Implemented
	12	Implemented
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1	1	Implemented

Seven recommendations were targeted for implementation and three were implemented in the 3rd Quarter of 2017. Three additional recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule.

Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 3

Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013

Rec #8 We recommend that the Municipal Accommodations Division of the Planning, Property and Development Department install a 150 mm diameter black disc on the pool bottom. The black disc on the bottom of the pool should be located on a white background. If the pool bottom is painted a colour other than white, the area surrounding the black disc should be white. This is an important tool for staff to use to determine water clarity on an ongoing basis in order to determine if a swimming pool should remain operational.

Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1

Rec #1 We recommend that the Infrastructure Planning Division of the Corporate Finance Department include the minimum requirements for capital project status reporting as recommended by the Government Finance Officers Association.

Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit

Rec #5 We recommend that the Director of EMSB, in consultation with the WFPS Manager of Finance, develop a process to determine when it is appropriate to outsource work.

Rec #11 We recommend that the Director of EMSB develop a practice to maintain current regulatory documentation and make readily available for staff.

Rec #12 We recommend that the Director of EMSB, in coordination with the Manager of Finance and the Deputy Chief of Support Services, develop a life-cycle costing analysis to facilitate informed decisions on when vehicles should be replaced.

Rec #13 We recommend that the EMSB account for parts inventory in accordance with generally accepted accounting principles.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 3

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 3

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				4 th Qtr 2017	1 st Qtr 2018	2 nd Qtr 2018 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10		6	9, 10
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27	9, 13	1	1		
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1			1
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9	9		2, 4, 5, 6
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15	12	-			
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2		
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	13	13		
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			5
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5	5		
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	-	1, 2, 3, 9, 10	1, 2, 3, 9, 10		
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1	1	-	-			
TOTAL			19	10	1	8

The Public Service has reported that ten of the 19 recommendations in progress should be implemented by December 31, 2017. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	27	24	2	96%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013 *	15	14	1	100%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	13	12		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	10		67%
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1 *	1	1		100%
TOTAL	132	107	6	86%

As at September 30, 2017, 107 of the 132 recommendations (86%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.

* All of the recommendations from the Safety Review of Aquatics Services, and Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1 have now been addressed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2017 – Quarter 4*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 4	2
Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 4.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 4	3
Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 4	4
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	5

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2017 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five (5) years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2017 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
311 Contact Centre Audit	13	Implemented
Community By-Law Enforcement Services Audit	5	1 st Qtr 2018
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit	2	2 nd Qtr 2018
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority Audit	1	Implemented
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	9	2 nd Qtr 2018
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit *	1	4 th Qtr 2017
	2	4 th Qtr 2017
	3	4 th Qtr 2017
	9	4 th Qtr 2017
	10	4 th Qtr 2017

Ten (10) recommendations were targeted for implementation and two (2) were implemented in the 4th Quarter of 2017. No additional recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule.

* Winnipeg Fire Paramedic Service management did not provide a management update or revised implementation date for the five (5) Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit recommendations.

Recommendations Completed in 2017 Qtr 4

311 Contact Centre Audit

Rec #13 We recommend management consider conducting a comprehensive Customer Service Satisfaction Survey to evaluate all aspects of 311 services.

Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority

Rec #1 The WPA should establish a facility maintenance reserve or retain sufficient earnings to fund the required future maintenance of the parking facilities.

Management has a process defined for the three (3) lots under the authority of WPA. Planning, Property & Development Department has assumed responsibility for 283 parking lots but has not established a maintenance reserve targeted towards parking lots. Planning, Property & Development Department is applying the asset management principles for investment planning; however, given the current financial situation and the infrastructure deficit, the work identified by the condition assessments for parking lots is not of high enough priority to be funded at this time. Until such time as there is sufficient funding, or immediate capital needs become of higher priority over other infrastructure work, this process will remain; requests will continue to be submitted to the budget process if required.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2017 Qtr 4

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2017 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				4 th Qtr 2017	2 nd Qtr 2018	3 rd Qtr 2018 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	6		9, 10
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27	9, 13	-			
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1		1	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9	5	6, 9	2, 4
Safety Review of Aquatics Services, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15	12	-			
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2		2	
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13	-	-			
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			5
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5	5		
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	-	1, 2, 3, 9, 10			
Southwest Rapid Transitway (Stage 2) and Pembina Hwy Underpass Project Audit – Report 1	1	-	-			
TOTAL			19	10	1	8

The Public Service has reported that three (3) of the seventeen (17) recommendations in progress should be implemented by March 31, 2018. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority, 2011 *	27	25	2	100%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
311 Contact Centre Audit, 2014 *	13	13		100%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	10		67%
TOTAL	116	94	5	85%

As at December 31, 2017, 94 of the 116 recommendations (85%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.

* All of the recommendations from the Operational Review of the Winnipeg Parking Authority and 311 Contact Centre Audit, have now been addressed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2018 – Quarter 1*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 1	2
Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 1.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 1	3
Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 1	4
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	5

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 1

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five (5) years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Community By-Law Enforcement Services Audit	5	3 rd Qtr 2018
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	5	2 nd Qtr 2018
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit	6	3 rd Qtr 2018
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit *	1	Implemented
	9	Implemented
	10	Implemented

Three (3) recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 1st Quarter of 2018. No additional recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule.

* Winnipeg Fire Paramedic Service management implemented three (3) recommendations in the 1st Quarter of 2018 that were targeted for implementation in the 4th Quarter of 2017 for the Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit. The department did not provide an update for the 4th Quarter of 2017 status report.

Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 1

Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit

- Rec #1 We recommend that the Director of EMSB develop procedures to ensure that the Branch is keeping appropriate records in the electronic records including work performed by EMSB staff, vehicle reports from fire station staff, and work performed by external service providers.
- Rec #9 We recommend that the WFPS develop a needs assessment for information and procure an information system that will handle its information and reporting needs.

City Auditor comment:

The WFPS did not conduct an IS needs assessment for EMSB. The Department advised that they lacked funds to source an alternate platform and therefore worked with WMFA to enhance system functionality and embed into EMSB operational processes. There is ongoing effort to address data integrity and software support with WFMA.

- Rec #10 We recommend that the Director of EMSB develop a standard operating procedures manual to inform employees of requirements and their responsibilities outside of repairs.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 1

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				2 nd Qtr 2018	3 rd Qtr 2018	4 th Qtr 2018 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10		6, 9, 10	
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8	1	1		
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8	-	2, 4, 5, 6, 9	5, 6, 9	2, 4	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2			2
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5			5
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5		5	
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	-	2, 3		2, 3	
TOTAL			14	4	8	2

The Public Service has reported that four (4) of the fourteen (14) recommendations in progress should be implemented by June 30, 2018. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	1	89%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	4		44%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	13		87%
TOTAL	76	59	3	82%

As at March 31, 2018, fifty-nine (59) of the seventy-six (76) recommendations (82%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2018 – Quarter 2*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 2	2
Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 2.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 2.....	3
Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 2	4
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	5

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 2

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided. Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five (5) years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 2

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	5	3 rd Qtr
	6	3 rd Qtr
	9	Implemented
Review of Winnipeg Public Library Services Audit	1	Not to be Implemented
Waverley West Arterial Roads Project Audit *	5.1	Implemented
	5.5	Implemented

Four (4) recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 2nd Quarter of 2018 and three (3) were implemented in the 2nd Quarter of 2018. Two (2) recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule.

* Both recommendations are subs of a main recommendation.

Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 2

Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit

Rec #9 We recommend that management create a succession plan for the Equipment Coordinator position and consider the potential to automate certain functions of this position to reduce the reliance on this position.

Waverley West Arterial Roads Project Audit

Rec #5.1 We recommend that the Infrastructure Planning Division of the Corporate Finance Department make the following revisions to the draft Project Management Manual:

Project Integration Management

Project integration processes should be developed and documented, including:

- establishing a process for improving the project management tools on an ongoing basis
- creating a formalized project file format with guidance on file structure and content
- creating processes for including regular updates for critical project performance measures through site meeting agendas and minutes

Rec #5.5 We recommend that the Infrastructure Planning Division of the Corporate Finance Department make the following revisions to the draft Project Management Manual:

Project Communications Management

A process for obtaining required communications from project stakeholders should be developed and documented in the Project Management Manual.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 2

Review of Winnipeg Public Library Services

Rec #1 We recommend that the Community Services Department prepare a report for the consideration of City Council reviewing the current role and structure of the Board to determine whether a Governing Board would be more effective to oversee the operations of the library.

City Auditor Comment:

Specific to recommendation #1 of the Review of Winnipeg Public Library Services, Community Services Management indicated that the recommendation will not be implemented. The recommendation reviewed the governance structure of the Winnipeg Public Library Board. At the time of the audit, most other surveyed Canadian jurisdictions had a governing board model, whereas the City has an advisory board model; therefore, a recommendation was made for the department to study the model and report to City Council, as the authority to revise the model of the library board resides with City Council. The department has decided not to prepare and submit the recommended report to Council. The department has stated that they will maintain the advisory board model, as they believe that the current structure and Board has an effective and good working relationship with administration.

The recommendation should not be viewed as a commentary on the functioning of the Board, or that a change in governance structure is necessary. The focus was to evaluate how practices in other municipalities could potentially benefit Winnipeg.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 2

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				3 rd Qtr 2018	4 th Qtr 2018	1 st Qtr 2019 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	6	10	9
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9	8, 1				
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	2, 4, 5, 6		
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2			2
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5		5	
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5	5		
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	-	2, 3	2		3
TOTAL			12	7	2	3

The Public Service has reported that seven (7) of the twelve (12) recommendations in progress should be implemented by September 30, 2018. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Winnipeg Public Library Services, 2012	9	7	2	100%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	13		87%
TOTAL	76	60	4	84%

As at June 30, 2018, sixty (60) of the seventy-six (76) recommendations (84%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2018 – Quarter 3*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 3	2
Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 3.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 3.....	3
Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 3	4
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	5

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 3

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five (5) years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 3

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Community By-Law Enforcement Services Audit	5	4 th Qtr
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit	2	Implemented
	3	Implemented
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	2	4 th Qtr
	4	1 st Qtr 2019
	5	4 th Qtr
	6	4 th Qtr
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit	6	1 st Qtr 2019

Seven (7) recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 3rd Quarter of 2018. One (1) recommendation was implemented ahead of schedule.

Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 3

Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit

- Rec #2 Quality assurance plan developed and uploaded, which include daily checklists and inspection schedules.
- Rec #3 The EMSB work order log tracks down time in days per vehicle and the number of repairs performed by each technician.
 RTA tracks vehicle hours of operation since last inspection.
 Down time, repairs per technician and hours since last inspection are all used as departmental performance measures.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 3

None.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 3

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				4 th Qtr 2018	1 st Qtr 2019	2 nd Qtr 2019 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	6	9	10
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	2, 5, 6	4	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2			2
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5	5		
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4	6	5	5		
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	-	-			
TOTAL			10	6	2	2

The Public Service has reported that six (6) of the ten (10) recommendations in progress should be implemented by December 31, 2018. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	4	1	83%
Emergency Mechanical Services Branch Audit, 2015	15	15		100%
TOTAL	67	55	2	82%

As at September 30, 2018, fifty-five (55) of the sixty-seven (67) recommendations (82%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.



*Report to Audit Committee
Status of Audit Recommendations
Quarterly Report Card - Summary
2018 – Quarter 4*

To be leaders in building public trust in our civic government

Audit Department

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?	1
How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?.....	1
How long does the Audit Department follow up for?	1
Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 4	2
Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 4.....	3
Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 4	4
Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 4	5
Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date	6

Status of Audit Recommendations

Quarterly Report Card – 2018 Quarter 4

What is the Quarterly Report Card?

The Audit Department's work does not end when an audit report is presented to City Council. The most important component of an audit recommendation is its implementation. The Public Service provides a response to each audit recommendation in the Audit Report along with an action plan for completion. The subsequent implementation of the audit recommendations in accordance with the action plans is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- the specific recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter as indicated by the Public Service;
- the specific recommendations from each Audit report currently in progress and the target date for completion; and
- the number of Audit recommendations implemented to date.

How is the Quarterly Report Card produced?

The Audit Department provides a template of outstanding audit recommendations to the Department Director responsible for implementing the recommendations. The templates are forwarded to the Audit Department for review and compilation. Documentation supporting the implementation of recommendations is reviewed to confirm implementation has occurred. For recommendations in progress, an implementation strategy and timeframe is provided. For recommendations not to be implemented, an explanation is provided.

Overall, the *Quarterly Report Card* presents management's representations as to the status of recommendations implemented, in progress or not to be implemented. The *Quarterly Report Card* is produced at the end of March, June, September and December and is presented by the City Auditor at the next Audit Committee meeting along with any observations he may have.

How long does the Audit Department follow up for?

Quarterly Report Cards are typically completed for five (5) years following the issue date of an audit report, which may be extended as circumstances warrant. After the reporting period, the Audit Department prepares a final report to Audit Committee that provides a summary of recommendations implemented, in progress and not to be implemented. Included is a complete history of status updates relating to those recommendations not implemented. After presentation of this final report, the status of audit recommendations will no longer be tracked by the Audit Department. If there are significant concerns that cannot be satisfactorily addressed by the Public Service, the Audit Committee may propose a new audit of the subject entity.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2018 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Current Quarter	Revised Implementation Date
Community By-Law Enforcement Services Audit	5	Implemented
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	2	2 nd Qtr 2019
	5	1 st Qtr 2019
	6	1 st Qtr 2019
Waverley West Arterial Roads Project Audit	5.8	1 st Qtr 2019
	5.9	1 st Qtr 2019
* Legal Services Department Audit	2, 5, 9	Implemented
	3	3 rd Qtr 2019
	4	2 nd Qtr 2019
	8	Implemented ahead of schedule
* Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 30, 31, 32, 33, 35	Implemented (to be confirmed in Q3 2019)
	34	Implemented ahead of schedule (to be confirmed in Q3 2019)
* William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit	5	Implemented ahead of schedule
	7	Implemented

Eight (8) recommendations were targeted for implementation in the 4th Quarter of 2018. Three (3) recommendations were implemented ahead of schedule. Twenty-six (26) recommendations were implemented before or in the 4th Quarter of 2018.

* *New to the Quarterly Report Card process.*

Recommendations Completed in 2018 Qtr 4

Community By-Law Enforcement Services Audit	
Rec #5	Vehicles have been received from Winnipeg Fleet Management Agency (WFMA) in October 2018 and is currently operational.
Legal Services Department Audit	
Rec #2	Internal management systems to provide ongoing oversight of staff have been developed.
Rec #5	Legal Services, in consult with corporate management, have determined and developed criteria to identify files which have the potential for significant impact to the City of Winnipeg.
Rec #8	A business case was prepared and submitted to the 2019 budget process. Should the proposal be approved, it is anticipated that the implementation of the information system would occur prior to the end of Q4 of 2019.
Rec #9	The City Solicitor has regular monthly meetings scheduled with the CCSO to communicate critical issues.
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit	
Rec #'s 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35	Completed. <i>Implemented recommendations have not been confirmed by the City Auditor and will be done in Q3 2019 when facilities are open for season.</i>
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit	
Rec #5	The Administrative Report Template and Instructions document have been updated to include the minimum disclosures.
Rec #7	The Briefing Note and Briefing Note Template have been updated.

Recommendations Not To Be Implemented in 2018 Qtr 4

Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit	
Rec #17	Review completed. Swimming ability is tested to enter deep ends and admission standards include consideration of factors such as age, swimming ability, height, guardian supervision within arm's reach, lifejacket use and potential restrictions to the shallow end.
Rec #19	Not to be implemented. Management disagrees with recommendation. Currently, all outdoor pool tanks are light in colour, which meets the Manitoba Regulation. The Audit references Public Pool Safety Standards for best practice, which further states that in the event that this standard varies from a Provincial/Territorial regulation, the Provincial/Territorial regulation shall prevail. Management will discuss the recommendation of white tanks with Manitoba Public Health and possibly consider in the future. To ensure safety standards are consistent throughout the City of Winnipeg, any changes to the outdoor pool tank standard should also be consistently applied to indoor pool operations.
Rec #24	The roped off splash zone will not be implemented. As an alternative, the Province suggested considering painting the pool floor in the future to define the splash down zone rather than roping off the area.

Recommendations in Progress as at 2018 Qtr 4

Audit Report	Recommendation #s Implemented	Recommendation #s Not to be Implemented	Recommendations In Progress			
			Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				1 st Qtr 2019	2 nd Qtr 2019	3 rd Qtr 2019 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	9	6, 10	
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	5, 6	2, 4	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2		2	
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5	5		
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	1, 2, 3, 4, 5	6				
* By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018			1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	11		1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10
* Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	2, 5, 8, 9		1, 3, 4, 6, 7	6	1, 4	3, 7
* Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35	17, 19, 24	2, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 18, 29, 36		6	2, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 18, 29, 36
* William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	5, 7		1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15	1, 3	4, 13	2, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15
TOTAL			50	8	10	32

The Public Service has reported that eight (8) of the fifty (50) recommendations in progress should be implemented by March 30, 2019. The status of the recommendations in progress will be the focus of our next report card.

* *New to Quarterly Report Card Process.*

Audit Recommendations Implemented to Date

Report	Total Report Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented		
		Total Implemented	Total Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
Community By-law Enforcement Services Audit, 2015	6	5	1	100%
* By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
* Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	4		44%
* Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	22	3	69%
* William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	2		20%
TOTAL	123	69	5	60%

As at December 31, 2018, sixty-nine (69) of the one hundred twenty-three (123) recommendations (60%) contained in this Report Card have been completed.

* *New to Quarterly Report Card process.*



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations

2019 – Quarter 1 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card– 2019 Quarter 1- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

Status updates are provided to the Audit Department on a quarterly basis; after presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: <https://winnipeg.ca/audit/reports.stm>. An explanation is provided for any recommendations that will not be implemented; a targeted completion date is noted for implementation in progress.

Documentation supporting implementation is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for 5 years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress - 2019 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation #’s implemented	Recommendation #’s not to be implemented	Recommendation #s In Progress	Targeted for Completion in:		
				2nd Qtr 2019	3rd Qtr 2019	4 th Qtr 2019 or later
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	9		6, 10
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	2, 4, 5	6	
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2		2	
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 6	-	5.8, 5.9	5.8, 5.9		
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11		8,9,10	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	2, 5, 8, 9		1, 3, 4, 6, 7	1, 6	3, 4	7
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 To be confirmed by City Auditor during 2019 operating season	6, 16, 17, 19, 24	8, 10, 11, 13, 18, 36	8	10, 11, 36	13, 18
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	5, 7, 13		1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15	1, 3, 4, 15	2	6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14
TOTAL	68	6	43	12	11	20

Recommendations implemented in 2019 Qtr 1

William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit

13.	A Writing Style Guide has been released for use by the public service. (Implemented early)
-----	---

Recommendations that will not be implemented

	Recommendation	
6.	Ensure that signage detailing the City of Winnipeg Aquatic Facility Admission Standard is posted outside of all aquatic facilities.	<p>The review has been completed. Facility Admission Standards and Manitoba regulated rules are posted inside all locations. Admission requirements are reviewed in person where there are front desks, or close by staff, so that the supervision requirements can be explained. Many locations do not have a safe place to post additional admission standards signage <u>outside</u> of the facility. The Department is not in contravention of a Manitoba Regulation.</p> <p>The risk of not placing additional signage outside of aquatic facilities is that the Department misses an opportunity for more public education on the need for adult supervision of children and general water safety.</p>
16.	Arrange for a full Health & Safety Committee inspection review of all aquatics sites prior to opening for the 2018 season. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 6.1 – 6.5, Section 21, Section 35.15, Section 35)	<p>The review has been completed. Currently, Provincial Health inspections occur by the Province of Manitoba for each of the 10 outdoor pools and 81 wading pools in order to obtain seasonal operating permits. Internally staffed Health & Safety Committee inspections also occur at all 10 outdoor pools, using consistent standards and review criteria checklists; this includes the items identified on the list provided by the Lifesaving Society. The Department has also implemented monthly internal health and safety audits for all wading pool sites effective 2019 season.</p> <p>There are noted differences in practice between the sites. This indicates a training opportunity to ensure greater consistency in the work performed by the staff tasked with conducting the Workplace Safety Inspections.</p>

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2019 Qtr 1

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 1	Revised implementation date
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	5	2019 Qtr 2
Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit	6	2019 Qtr 3
Waverley West Arterial Roads Project Audit	5.8	2019 Qtr 2
Waverley West Arterial Roads Project Audit	5.9	2019 Qtr 2
Legal Services Department Audit	6	2019 Qtr 2
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit	9	2019 Qtr 2
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit	1	2019 Qtr 2
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit	3	2019 Qtr 2
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit	13	Implemented early

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estates Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverly West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	5		83%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	4		44%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	25 To be confirmed by City Auditor during 2019 operating season	5	83 %
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	3		20%
TOTAL	117	68	6	63 %



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department
Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations
2019 – Quarter 2 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card– 2019 Quarter Two- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

Status updates are provided to the Audit Department on a quarterly basis; after presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: <https://winnipeg.ca/audit/reports.stm>. An explanation is provided for any recommendations that will not be implemented; a targeted completion date is noted for implementation in progress.

Documentation supporting implementation is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for 5 years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress in 2019 Quarter Two:

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Targeted for Completion in:					
				3 rd Qtr 2019	4 th Qtr 2019	1 st Qtr 2020	2 nd Qtr 2020	3 rd Qtr 2020	4 th Qtr 2020 & beyond
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11,12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17,18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	9	6		10		
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	6	2,4,5				
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2					
Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	1, 2, 3, 4, 5.8, 5.9, 6	All recommendations have been implemented – Audit is closed							
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	11	8,9,10			1,3,4, 5,6	2,7
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	2, 5, 8, 9		1, 3, 4, 6, 7	Due to employee transition the implementation dates will be provided in 2019 Quarter 3					
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14, 15, 20,21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27,28, 29,30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 To be confirmed by City Auditor during 2019 operating season	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24	11, 13, 18, 36	11,36	18			13	
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1,3, 5, 7, 13,15		2,4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14,	2, 4	6,8,9, 10,11, 12,14				
TOTAL	74	6	37	8	15		1	6	2

Recommendations implemented in 2019 Quarter Two:

Waverley West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	
5.8	The Project Management Manual (v4) has been released internally and the section on environmental management has been updated.
5.9	The Project Management Manual (v4) has been released internally and includes a section on claims management.

William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	
1	The Project Management Manual (v4) has been released internally and includes the process map.
3	The Project Management Manual (v4) has been released internally and outlines the established process.
15	The Project Management Manual (v4) has been released internally and includes health, safety, security and environmental management

Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	
8	The wading pool attendant training was updated and completed.
10	Emergency stop buttons have been installed at the bottom and top of the waterslide at Kildonan Park Pool.

Recommendations that will not be implemented in 2019 Quarter Two: none

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2019 Quarter Two:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 2	Revised implementation date
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	2	2019 Qtr 4
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	4	2019 Qtr 4
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	5	2019 Qtr 4
Waverly West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	5.8; 5.9	Complete
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1	Due to employee transition the implementation dates will be provided in 2019 Quarter 3
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	6	Due to employee transition the implementation dates will be provided in 2019 Quarter 3
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	8	Complete
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	9	2019 Qtr 3
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1	Complete
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	3	Complete
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	4	2019 Qtr 3
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	Complete

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estates Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Waverly West Arterial Road Project Audit, 2014	6	6		100%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	4		44%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	27 To be confirmed by City Auditor during 2019 operating season	5	88%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	6		40%
TOTAL	117	74	6	68%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations

2019 – Quarter 3 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card– 2019 Quarter Three– Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

Status updates are provided to the Audit Department on a quarterly basis; after presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: <https://winnipeg.ca/audit/reports.stm>. An explanation is provided for any recommendations that will not be implemented; a targeted completion date is noted for implementation in progress.

Documentation supporting implementation is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for 5 years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress in 2019 Quarter 3:

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Targeted for Completion in:					
				2019 Qtr 4	2020 Qtr 1	2020 Qtr 2	2020 Qtr 3	2020 Qtr 4	2021 & beyond
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 11,12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17,18, 19	3	6, 9, 10	6, 9		10			
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6	2,4,5,6					
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2					
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	11		8,9,10		1,3,4, 5,6	2,7
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 8, 9		3, 4, 6, 7		3,4,7			6	
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 21, 23, 27, 28, 29, 32	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	1, 2, 4, 11,12,13, 14,15, 18, 20, 22, 25, 26, 30, 31, 33, 35, 36	12, 18		2,11,13	1,4,14,15 20,22,25, 26,30,31, 33,35,36		
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 13, 15		2, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14,	6,	8, 9,10, 11,12,14			2	
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3 *1.8, 4.2 *to be confirmed by City Auditor in 2019 Qtr 4	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7, 1.9, 3.1 , 4.1, 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.7, 1.9, 3.1, 4.1, 5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5					
TOTAL	65	11	57	19	9	7	13	7	2

Recommendations implemented in 2019 Quarter Three:

Legal Services Department Audit, 2018		
No.	Recommendation:	Action
1	The City Solicitor should review organizational structure options with the aim to implement a structure that supports risk management, management development and succession planning within the available compensation schedules.	The new organizational structure has been implemented to support risk management, management development and succession planning.

William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018		
No.	Recommendation	Action
4	<p>We recommend that the Chief Administrative Officer ensure that any project detail sheets related to a major capital project in the capital budget include the following minimum disclosures:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Description of the major components (project scope) 2. Reference to the City planning by-law from which the project originated 3. Major benefits of constructing the projects 4. Significant risks of constructing the project 5. Significant risks of not constructing or deferring the project 	Capital budget training and departmental budget presentations include documenting the required disclosures.

[Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019](#)

No.	Recommendation	Action
1.1	<p>Management should consider the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Additional ongoing training at regular intervals to ensure file preparers are versed in how to appropriately address specific items and related documentation in the Complete Reporting Checklist. • Identify a process for Management to contact the auditor to discuss any items of uncertainty identified as part of their review as it relates to provided sufficient and appropriate audit evidence. 	<p>Staff training is ongoing, all checklists /documentation are re reviewed by the Real Estate Administrator, and discussions with the IFC are held as required.</p>
1.2	<p>Recommendation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management should consider how to ensure that documentation of diligence associated with its review of the draft administrative report, Complete Reporting Checklist, and related attachments against the RETMF requirements is completed prior to submitting the administrative report to SPCPDHDD/Council for approval. • Management should consider where modifications to the Complete Reporting Checklist template may be required to provide for the documentation of their review and approval of these documents, prior to submission. 	<p>Action</p> <p>The Real Estate Administrator reviews all RETMF materials, the checklist has been revised.</p>
1.4	<p>Recommendation</p> <p>Management should consider if a standardized template should be created to assist in the documentation of the rationale relating to each of the considerations noted in our observation, as well as evidence of approval of the associated determinations by Management and the Appraisal Branch (as required by the RETMF). This template should be developed with consideration to the level of documentation and rigor of analysis that would be appropriate to satisfy the intent of the RETMF.</p>	<p>Action</p> <p>Management has issued an IFC checklist to employees that outline common file deficiencies as well as the common report deficiencies Should other common items of non-compliance be identified; the checklist will be updated accordingly.</p>

No. 1.5	Recommendation The Transaction Appraisal Template should include a requirement to document, where an external appraiser is required, the Appraisal Branch’s considerations regarding: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management’s considerations relating to the use of a competitive procurement process and engagement of Materials Management in the selection of an external appraiser, in accordance with the RETMF; and • In cases where an external appraiser was selected from the pre-approved list, confirmation of the appraiser’s pre-approval with respect to the particular type of appraisal required. 	Action The RETMF is clear where an external appraiser is required. Management consulted with Materials Management and Legal Services with respect to the competitive bid process, pre-approved list and the creation of an appraisal contract. The Canadian Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice dictate the type of property which a professional can appraise.
No. 1.8	Recommendation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management should consider formalized and documented guidelines that are clear as to the required recipients of Information Circulars under various applicable circumstances. • The RETMF Complete Reporting Checklists should be amended to include documentation of responses received to Information Circulars. 	Action Real Estate information circulars are standardized and do not change from property to property or from employee to employee. The circulation is addressed through an established email distribution list. Circulation responses will be included in the RETMF checklist.
No. 1.10	Recommendation Management and Legal Services should consider how it can formalize a process to ensure that Legal Services’ confirmation and approval of transaction legal documentation in its final form is documented and retained in the Transaction file.	Action Legal Services will provide email confirmation that the terms and conditions are finalized – this document will be included in the file.
No. 1.11	Recommendation Management should ensure that a Risk and Complexity tool is completed, reviewed, and retained within each Transaction file, as required by the RETMF.	Action Risk and Complexity Tools are completed, reviewed and filed in the transaction file.
No. 2.1	Recommendation Management should formalize and document clear guidelines as to the required recipients of Information Circulars under various applicable circumstances and types of transaction.	Action Real Estate information circulars are standardized and do not change from property to property or from employee to employee. The circulation is addressed through an established email distribution list. Circulation responses will be included in the RETMF checklist.

No. 2.3	Recommendation Management should consider an amendment to the Framework which removes this criterion (Criteria 4.01 delegation of transaction approval), and consider the implementation of an alternate process, if required, to ensure compliance with the criterion.	Action Maintaining the delegation of transaction approval (Criterion 4.01) within the RETMF is necessary for management’s purposes to confirm completion of all steps in the transaction process. As this step takes place after IFC review, discussion between management, Audit and IFC will be initiated to discuss removal of Criteria 4.01 from the Compliance Framework.
No. 4.2	Recommendation A review of the current status of the Tracking Database and requirements to complete and implement the database should be undertaken. This implementation process should be formalized and progress against it monitored by City Audit.	Action The sales tracking and the leasing database are updated monthly and will be integrated into AMANDA. The acquisition tracking database already resides in AMANDA. .

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2019 Quarter Three:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 3	Revised implementation date
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	9	2019 Qtr 4
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	6	2019 Qtr 4
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	2019 Qtr 4
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	2019 Qtr 4
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1 Implemented in 2019 Qtr 3	
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	11	2020 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	2020 Qtr 3
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	2	2020 Qtr 4
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	4	Implemented

Recommendations that will not be implemented:

Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018

No.	Recommendation	Rationale
34	Review the placement of the buoy line that separates the deep end from the shallow end.	Current practice exceeds the Manitoba Health Regulations by having buoy lines. Non-swimmers are restricted to the shallow end.

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019

No.	Recommendation	Rationale
1.3	Management should consider how it can evidence that the appraisal requirement is considered for all Transactions. A standardized template (the "Transaction Appraisal Template") is an example of what can be created to provide documentation and evaluation by the Appraisal Branch of the rationale where it is deemed an appraisal is not required.	Management has elected to order appraisals for all transactions, including non-profit leases/sales. Management does not intend to bring forward administrative reports without an appraised value. It is noted that appraisals are not required where Council has a preapproved rent/price (e.g. Fees and Charges Schedule).
1.6	Management should consider how the Complete Reporting Checklist should be amended to provide for documentation of review of the property appraisal by an accredited member of the AIC as well as a member of RED or PMB (as applicable to the Transaction). This documentation should include the name of the reviewer, date of review, verification that the form of documentation is compliant with the RETMF, as well as evidence of the reviewed document in the file.	The checklists and appraisal reviews can function independently and combining the two may impact productivity. The Checklist and Appraisal Review Memo now provide a sufficient level of review.

No. 2.2	Recommendation A review as to the relevance of an appraisal with respect to particular types of transaction should be undertaken by PP&D. To the extent that it is agreed and determined appropriate that an appraisal would not be warranted for a specific Transaction or circumstance, the RETMF should be amended to provide for these situations.	Rationale Management has elected to order appraisals for all transactions, including non-profit leases/sales. Management does not intend to bring forward administrative reports without an appraised value. It is noted that appraisals are not required where Council has a preapproved rent/price (e.g. Fees and Charges Schedule).
No. 5.2	Recommendation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appraisal requirements with respect to non-monetary or non-market transactions should be formalized in order to clarify the conditions that would warrant an appraisal to be performed (e.g. driven by nature of transaction or order-of-magnitude estimate of value). • Appraisal requirements and complete reporting requirements related to opportunity costs and non-monetary Transactions should be reviewed by PP&D to ensure the objectives of the RETMF are fully met, and the RETMF amended accordingly. 	Rationale Management has elected to order appraisals for all transactions, including non-profit leases/sales. Management does not intend to bring forward administrative reports without an appraised value. It is noted that appraisals are not required where Council has a preapproved rent/price (e.g. Fees and Charges Schedule).

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011	19	15	1	84%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	5		56%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	12	6	50%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	7		47%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	10	4	54%
TOTAL	133	65	11	55%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department
Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations
2019 – Quarter 4 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card– 2019 Quarter Four- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress –2019 Quarter 4

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress					
				2020 Qtr 1	2020 Qtr 2	2020 Qtr 3	2020 Qtr 4	2021 Qtr 1	2021 Qtr 2 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	11	8,9,10			1,3,4,6	2, 5, 7
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 4.1, 4.2, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7, 1.9, 3.1, 5.1, 5.3, 5.4	1.7, 5.3,	1.9,5.1 5.4	3.1			
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 8, 9	-	3, 4, 6, 7		3,		4, 6, 7		
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2		2				
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	1, 3, 7, 8, 9	-	2, 4, 5, 6* Final report						
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 21, 23, 25, 27, 28, 29, 32	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	1, 2, 4, 11,12,13, 14,15, 18, 20, 22, 26, 30, 31, 33, 35, 36		12,13, 18	1,2,4, 11,14,15, 20,22,26, 30,31,33, 35,36			
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12,13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6			6			
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 13, 15	-	2, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14,		8, 9,10, 11,12, 14		2		
TOTAL	71	11	47* does not include Review of the Hired Equipment Process	3	17	16	4	4	3

[Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012](#)

The Review of the Hired Equipment Process was completed in June 2012. The report made nine recommendations which Public Works management planned to implement. As of December 31, 2019 five recommendations have been implemented. The Audit Department has been tracking the implementation of the Audit recommendations for 7.5 years, 30 quarters. The Department advised that due to competing priorities, workload and employee churn four recommendations have not been implemented. The Audit Department will no longer be tracking the status of these recommendations.

With these four recommendations not being implemented the Department is operating with an increased level of risk in this area. Systems are susceptible to data entry errors due to a lack of preventative controls and the absence of review by a senior foreman reduces the likelihood of timely identification of errors. Further, employee decisions may not be consistent due to a lack of documented substitution and replacement procedures.

“Recommendation 2: We recommend that changes to TKMMS be made to incorporate sufficient preventive controls in order to reduce the potential for errors. Specifically, these controls should include:

- displaying a notification when data for the same piece of equipment indicates continuous work at different locations*
- prevent the same piece of equipment from being billed for more than one job at the same time*
- allow a maximum of 24 billable hours per unit per day*
- automate the calculation of the overtime premium*

Recommendation 4:

We recommend that management investigate the feasibility of integrating the Equipment Scheduler and TKMMS applications

Recommendation 5:

We recommend that management implement a process where the senior foreman would sign-off on a review of the hired equipment summary transactions and include regular trend analysis and exception reporting to detect potential errors or fraudulent work tickets.

Recommendation 6:

We recommend that formal procedures be created to manage substitutions and replacements as defined in the Bid Opportunity, and that the process is properly documented.”

The Review of the Hired Equipment Process Audit recommendation implementation tracking is finished.

Recommendations implemented in 2019 Quarter 4:

[Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019](#)

No.	Recommendation	Action
1.8	<p>Management should consider formalized and documented guidelines that are clear as to the required recipients of Information Circulars under various applicable circumstances.</p> <p>The RETMF Complete Reporting Checklists should be amended to include documentation of responses received to Information Circulars.</p>	<p>Circulars are standardized and do not change from property to property or from staff to staff. The circulation is addressed through an email mailing list which cannot be altered by staff.</p>
2.3	<p>Management should consider an amendment to the Framework which removes this criterion (4.01), and consider the implementation of an alternate process, if required, to ensure compliance with the criterion.</p>	<p>The RETMF did not specifically identify 4.01 as a requirement. Appendix B & P identifies who approves a particular type of report and the checklists identifies who needs to approve a transaction.</p> <p>The checklists identify the approval after the report review and submission.</p>
4.1	<p>In future instances where PP&D attributes non-compliance to in-process improvements related to the RETMF, Management should provide a clear implementation timeline with respect to the deficient item(s) in their unaudited responses. This implementation timeline should be formalized and progress against it monitored by City Audit.</p>	<p>The quarterly report card updates provide evidence of the implementation timeline.</p>
4.2	<p>A review of the current status of the Tracking Database and requirements to complete and implement the database should be undertaken. This implementation process should be formalized and progress against it monitored by City Audit.</p>	<p>Tracking databases have been developed and are updated monthly.</p>

No.	Recommendation	Action
5.5	The Complete Reporting requirements within the RETMF (Appendix B) should be amended to require disclosure of the rationale for not completing an appraisal to be reported to SPCPDHDD/Council.	Management has elected to order appraisals for all transactions, including non-profit leases/sales. Management does not intend to bring forward administrative reports without an appraised value. It is noted that appraisals are not required where Council has a preapproved rent/price (e.g. Fees and Charges Schedule).

[William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018](#)

No.	Recommendation:	Action
6	We recommend the Chief Administrative Officer direct Corporate Human Resources to developing courses for report writers to provide guidance and hands on training through classroom sessions.	The Administrative Writing Basics course is finalized and is posted to our Employee Development intranet site for employees to access.

Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011

No. 9	Recommendation: We recommend the Traffic Signals Branch develop and report on, a comprehensive set of performance measures for each key area of the business. The performance measures should be linked to the Branch's goals and objectives and targets should be established for each measure.	Action The 2018 Annual report is complete and will be published shortly.
No. 10	Recommendation: The Traffic Signals Branch should implement a comprehensive preventative maintenance program. Resources should be reviewed and analyzed to ensure adequate staffing either internally or externally exist to implement the program.	Action Traffic Signals Operations have created a preventative maintenance schedule, which is tied into the allocated budgetary amount to ensure a fully resourced proactive maintenance program is planned with regards to our available resources.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2019 Quarter 4:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 4	Revised implementation date
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	2020 Qtr 1
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.9	2020 Qtr 2
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	3.1	2020 Qtr 3
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	5.4	2020 Qtr 2
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	2020 Qtr 2
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	2, 4, 5, 6	City Auditor will no longer be tracking implementation status of these recommendations.
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	12	2020 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	18	2020 Qtr 2
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	6	2020 Qtr 3

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	12	6	82%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Review of the Hired Equipment Process, 2012	9	5		56%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	13	6	50%
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011	19	17	1	94%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	8		53%
TOTAL	133	73	11	63%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations

2020 – Quarter 1 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card- 2020 Quarter 1- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress –2020 Quarter 1

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress					
				2020 Qtr 2	2020 Qtr 3	2020 Qtr 4	2021 Qtr 1	2021 Qtr 2	2021 Qtr 3 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11		8, 9, 10,11			1, 3, 4, 5, 6,	2, 7
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 4.1, 4.2, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7, 1.9, 3.1, 5.1, 5.3	1.9, 5.1,	1.7, 3.1, 5.3				
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 8, 9	-	3, 4, 6, 7			3, 4, 6, 7			
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2					
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 21, 23, 25, 27, 28, 29, 32	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	1, 2, 4, 11,12,13, 14,15, 18, 20, 22, 26, 30, 31, 33, 35, 36	12,13, 18	1,2,4, 11,14,15 20,22,26 30,31,33 35, 36				
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12,13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6		6				
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 13, 15	-	2, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14,			2,8, 9,10, 11,12 14			
TOTAL	67	11	46	6	22	11	0	5	2

Recommendations implemented in 2020 Quarter 1:

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019		
No.	Recommendation	Action
5.4	The criteria and guidance of the risk and complexity tool should be reviewed and amended as appropriate by Management to ensure that the guidance included in the tool is sufficiently clear, and documentation as to the specific ratings of each section are required to a level such that an individual with a reasonable and comparable understanding of the Transaction could come to the same conclusion for each individual criteria.	The risk and complexity tool has been rescored, wherein a lower threshold is required to require RFPs. Any score which is around the minimum threshold (above or below) is reviewed by staff. Management will continue to monitor the tool

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2020 Quarter 1:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 4	Revised implementation date
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	2020 Qtr 3
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.7	2020 Qtr 3
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	5.3	2020 Qtr 3

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	13	4	77%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	13	6	50%
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011	19	17	1	95%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	8		53%
TOTAL	124	66	11	63%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department
Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations
2020 – Quarter 2 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card- 2020 Quarter 2- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress –2020 Quarter 2

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress					
				2020 Qtr 3	2020 Qtr 4	2021 Qtr 1	2021 Qtr 2	2021 Qtr 3	2021 Qtr 4 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	8, 9, 10, 11				1, 3, 4, 5, 6	2, 7,
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 4.1, 4.2, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7, 1.9, 3.1, 5.1, 5.3	1.7, 5.1, 5.3	1.9, 3.1				
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 8, 9	-	3, 4, 6, 7		3, 4, 6, 7				
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2					
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 21, 23, 25, 27, 28, 29, 32 to be confirmed the Audit Dept in 2020 Qtr 3: 1, 2, 4, 11,12,13, 14,15, 22, 26, 30, 31, 36	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	18, 20, 33, 35,		18			20,33, 35	
Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit, 2011	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12,13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19	3	6 *final report						
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	2, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14,		2, 12		8,9, 10,14		
TOTAL	81	11	31 *does not include Traffic Signals	8	9		4	8	2

Audit Recommendations - Quarterly Status Report, 2020 – Quarter 2- Summary

[Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit. November 2010](#)

The Traffic Signals Branch Performance Audit was completed in November 2010. The report made 19 recommendations which Public Works management planned to implement.

As of June 2020, 17 recommendations have been implemented; in 2014 Qtr 4 it was reported that one recommendation would not be implemented. The Audit Department has been tracking the implementation of the Audit recommendations for eight years, 34 quarters.

The specific recommendation that has not been implemented is:

Recommendation 6:

“Traffic Signals Branch management should develop procedures in regards to the submission, review and approval of overtime claims for travel time and should implement a process to ensure all overtime hours claimed are valid and supportable.”

The Department has reported that work has been completed on this recommendation such as: work hours were revised to provide 24/7 coverage for emergencies; IS was working toward paperless timekeeping system; a delay in the implementation of TKMMS impacted implementation; and that there are currently ongoing internal discussions on protocols to manage emergency OT.

With this recommendation not being implemented, the Department is operating with an increased level of risk in this area.

Overtime is a normal and appropriate expenditure for meeting temporary spikes in workload demands. Implementing a process for submission and review of overtime claims may decrease overtime expenditures as well as ensure all claims are valid and supportable. Without processes in place there is a risk of non verifiable OT time claims, which may ultimately have financial impact.

The Audit recommendation implementation tracking is now complete and the audit will be closed.

Recommendations implemented in 2020 Quarter 2:

William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018		
No. 11	Recommendation:	Action
	The Chief Administrative Officer should ensure the roles and responsibilities of Corporate Communications and of the Office of Public Engagement are formalized, documented and communicated to all departments.	City of Winnipeg Policy No. CO-013 was adopted by City Council effective September 26, 2019. Section 7 outlines the responsibilities for public engagement.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2020 Quarter 2:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 2	Revised implementation date
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.9	2020 Qtr 4
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	5.1	2020 Qtr 3
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	2020 Qtr 3
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	18	2020 Qtr 4

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	13	4	77%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	5		56%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	26 *13 implementations to be confirmed 2020 Qtr 3	6	88%
Traffic Signals Performance Audit, 2011 City Auditor will no longer be tracking implementation status of these recommendations.	19	17	1	95%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	9		60%
TOTAL	124	81	11	74%

Audit Recommendations - Quarterly Status Report, 2020 – Quarter 2- Summary



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department
Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations
2020 – Quarter 3 Summary

For more information visit: Winnipeg.ca/audit

Quarterly Report Card- 2020 Quarter 3- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Quarterly reports are typically completed for five years following the issue date of an audit report.

Recommendations in Progress –2020 Quarter 3

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress					
				2020 Qtr 4	2021 Qtr 1	2021 Qtr 2	2021 Qtr 3	2021 Qtr 4	2022 Qtr 1 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11	8, 9, 10,	11			1, 3, 4, 5, 6	2, 7
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 3.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7*, 1.9, 5.1*,	1.7* 5.1*	1.9**				
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 6, 8, 9	-	3, 4, 7	3, 7		4			
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2	2					
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 21, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 36	6, 16, 17, 19, 24, 34	2, 14, 15, 18, 20, 22, 31, 33, 35,	2, 18		14, 15, 20, 22, 31, 33, 35			
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	2, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14,	2		8, 9, 10, 12, 14			
TOTAL	62	10	33	11	2	13		5	2
<p>*1.7/*5.1 PPD has developed client questionnaires , to date no client requests have been processed for this type of transaction **1.9 is under review by Legal Services.</p>									

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

Outdoor aquatic facilities operate for a short season, recommendations that were reported as implemented in 2020 Quarter 2 were subject to confirmation by the Audit Department in 2020 Qtr 3. Recommendations said to be implemented that could not be confirmed by the Auditor will be reviewed in 2021 Qtr 3.

Recommendation:	Action:
<p>1. Ensure that facility first aid kits are stocked to the level required by regulation at all times. Review and revise policies and procedures around the checking and stocking of first aid kits. (Manitoba Regulation P210 - 132/97, Section 10 [1] and Schedule B)</p> <p>Lead: Aquatic Services Division</p>	<p>Audit confirmed that management has developed the required policy/procedure. Upon site inspection, the Auditor was unable to confirm employee compliance.</p> <p>Management advises that they have addressed the performance issues of non-compliance.</p> <p>The Audit Department requested that Management monitor employee compliance and take appropriate action as required.</p>
<p>4. Add a pool outlet/drain cover check to the operating procedures for all outdoor pools, and ensure that these checks are conducted and logged at least once a month.</p> <p>Lead: Planning Property & Development</p>	<p>PPD added to Computer Maintenance Management System (CMMS) or Maximo to generate a work order, which will require a response.</p> <p>The Auditor confirmed implementation.</p>
<p>11. Complete a full review of lifeguard coverage zones in the facility. Conduct a review of all facility positioning, scanning and rotation charts at all outdoor pools to ensure that they are effective tools to advise employees of the areas of responsibility and coverage.</p> <p>2. Lead: Aquatic Services Division</p>	<p>Audit confirmed that management has developed the required policy/procedure. Upon site inspection, the Auditor was unable to confirm employee compliance.</p> <p>Management advises that they have addressed the performance issues of employee non-compliance.</p> <p>The Audit Department requested that Management monitor employee compliance and take appropriate action as required.</p>
<p>12. Review procedures on how employee's certifications/training records are recorded, stored and maintained. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132/97, Section 12 [2] & Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132/97, Section 43)</p> <p>Lead: Aquatic Services Division</p>	<p>Management updated the Qualification template used to track employee's certifications/training records.</p> <p>The Auditor confirmed that the template for recording qualifications was updated to reference the appropriate expiry date to be recorded. This</p>

	template was not used for hour selection for the summer of 2020 as qualifications were extended due to Covid-19.
13. Develop site specific procedure manuals for all outdoor pools and wading pools. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132/97, Section 23.1) Lead: Aquatic Services Division	Site specific procedure manuals have been implemented. The Auditor confirmed implementation
26. Review safety precautions for metal hatches/panels located on the pool deck. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132/97, Section 8(2)) Lead: Planning, Property and Development	‘Place Mats on the metal drain cover’ was added to the daily checklist and the Auditor confirmed implementation.
30. Ensure that all cylinders of compressed gas are secured against falling over. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 19.10)	‘Confirm that compressed gas cylinders are properly secured’ was added to the daily checklist and the Auditor confirmed implementation.

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-	
Recommendation	Action
<p>Section 3: Certain types of transactions were not specifically contemplated within the Compliance Framework.</p> <p>3.1 These transaction types should be reviewed in light of the RETMF as well as other applicable City by-laws, policies, and procedures to determine the appropriate criteria to ensure a Transaction is completed in a fair, transparent and open manner.</p> <p>Management should formalize and document these criteria through an amendment to the Compliance Framework.</p>	<p>Evaluation criteria was developed, the Real Estate Branch developed checklists for transaction types not considered by the RETMF –these checklists are currently in use.</p>
<p>5.3 Certain aspects of the RETMF require further clarification</p> <p>The RETMF competitive procurement guidelines in Appendix D and F should be reviewed by PP&D, and revised to ensure that these elements of compensation are appropriately analyzed and disclosed to decision makers.</p>	<p>The acquisition checklist has been updated to identify how the compensation was estimated and that the source is disclosed in the Administrative Report.</p>

Audit Recommendations - Quarterly Status Report, 2020 – Quarter 3- Summary

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2020 Quarter 3:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 3	Revised implementation date
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.7	PPD has developed client questionnaires, no client requests have been processed for this type of this type of transaction
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	5.1	PPD has developed client questionnaires, no client requests have been processed for this type of this type of transaction
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	2020 Qtr 4
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	2	2020 Qtr 4
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	14	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	15	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	18	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	22	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	31	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	33	2021 Qtr 2

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11			0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	15	4	86%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	6		66%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	21	6	75%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	9		60%
TOTAL	105	81	11	63%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department
Quarterly Report Card – Audit Recommendations
2020 – Quarter 4 Summary

For more information visit: [Winnipeg.ca/audit](https://www.winnipeg.ca/audit)

Quarterly Report Card- 2020 Quarter 4- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

The Quarterly Report Card summarizes the status of:

- recommendations targeted for completion in the current quarter (as indicated by the Public Service)
- recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion
- the number of recommendations implemented to date

Recommendations in Progress –2020 Quarter 4

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress				
				2021 Qtr 1	2021 Qtr 2	2021 Qtr 3	2021 Qtr 4	2022 Qtr 1 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11		8, 9,10,11			1, 2,3, 4, 5, 6, 7
New this quarter: ContinuousMonitoring- AdvisoryReportApril2020	-	-	1				1	
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 3.1 ,4.1, 4.2,5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.7*, 1.9**, 5.1*	1.7* 1.9** 5.1*				
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 5, 6, 8, 9	-	3, 4, 7	3, 7	4			
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2		2			
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11,12, 13, 21, 23, 25, 26,27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 36	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	2, 14, 15,18, 20, 22, 31, 33, 35,		2, 14, 15 18, 20, 22, 31, 33, 35			
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	2, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14,	2	8, 9, 10, 12, 14			
TOTAL	62	10	34	6	20	-	1	7
<p>1.7*/5.1* PPD has developed client questionnaires and market analysis templates , to date no client requests have been processed for this type of transaction</p> <p>1.9** is under review by Legal Services.</p>								

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2020 Quarter 4:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 4	Revised implementation date
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	8	2021 Qtr 2
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	9	2021 Qtr 2
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	10	2021 Qtr 2
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.7	PPD has developed client questionnaires and a market analysis template, no client requests have been processed for this type of transaction
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	5.1	PPD has developed client questionnaires and a market analysis template, no client requests have been processed for this type of transaction
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	3	2021 Qtr 2
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	7	2021 Qtr 2
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	2	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	2	2021 Qtr 2
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	18	2021 Qtr 2
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	2	2021 Qtr 1

There were no recommendations implemented in 2020 Quarter 4

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations	Recommendations Implemented	Recommendations Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	-	-	0%
ContinuousMonitoring- AdvisoryReportApril2020	1	-	-	0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	22	15	4	86%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	9	6		66%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11		92%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	21	6	75%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	9		60%
TOTAL	106	62	10	68%



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report
2021 – Quarter 1

For more information visit: [Winnipeg.ca/audit](https://www.winnipeg.ca/audit)

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report- 2021 Quarter 1- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

April 2021: Quarterly Report on the Implementation of Audit Recommendations for the period ending March 31, 2021

This report summarizes the status of:

- the number of recommendations implemented to date
- the number of recommendations that will not be implemented
- implementation of recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations				
	Total	Implemented	In Progress	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	-	11	-	0%
Continuous Monitoring- Advisory Report April 2020	1	-	1	-	0%
Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations- July 2019	22	17	1	4	95%
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018 Final report -all recommendations have been implemented	9	9	0		100%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	11	1		92%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	22	8	6	77%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	10	5		67%
TOTAL	106	69	27	10	74%

Recommendations implemented in 2021 Qtr 1

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019		
1.7	Management should consider developing a standard market analysis template to ensure that a consistent approach is utilized, and that the analysis completed is appropriate and sufficiently thorough in every instance.	The market analysis and client questionnaires have been developed and reviewed by the City Auditor – to date no client requests have been processed for this type of transactions.

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019		
5.1	<p>A standard market analysis template should be created that clearly outlines and describes the full scope of inputs, analyses and disclosures required for a complete market analysis. These include, but are not limited to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All criteria presented in the RETMF related to various occupancy costs on a total basis or cost per square foot; • Total estimated leasehold costs per year; • Total expected cost to the City for each specific location; • The Client Requirements Questionnaire in Appendix I of the RETMF should be required to be submitted with all client department requests for a property from PMB and RED; and • Amendments to the RETMF for the deficiencies observed should be considered by Management. • We also recommend that certain procedural elements associated with the completion of a market analysis, such as the process for undertaking a market scan, are clearly formalized within the template. 	The market analysis and client questionnaires have been developed and reviewed by the City Auditor – to date no client requests have been processed for this type of transaction.

Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018		
18	Adopt a medical condition admission standard. (implemented early)	The medical admission standard has been adopted. Signs at facility entrances will include: <i>Consult with a medical professional to determine the effect of your current health prior to starting any physical activity. And The user understands and assumes all risks associated with the use of any facilities or amenities on these premises.</i>

[William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018](#)

2	We recommend that the Chief Administrative Officer create a process to ensure that major infrastructure commitments contained in secondary plan by-laws are completely capture in master plan documents for the City Implemented as targeted	The CAO approved the terms of reference for the PEAC (Planning Executive Advisory Committee) on February 1, 2021.
----------	---	---

[Legal Services Department Audit, 2018](#)

3	Legal Services management should further develop the risk management program to identify the potential risks facing service delivery, the systems and processes in place to mitigate those risks and the resulting residual risk facing the Department. Implemented early	Implementation of a file tracking process and the centralized intake system for Legal Services Requests (LSR) have resulted in implementation of this recommendation. Legal Services will continue to look to implementing enhancements to risk management processes on an ongoing basis. As examples, in Q1 2021 further enhancements are being made to LSR and an Enterprise Content Management System (document management system) is under development and targeted for implementation in 2021.
----------	--	---

[Legal Services Department Audit, 2018](#)

4	Legal Services management should implement a file review process that includes conducting a quality control check of key information supported by a risk-based review of other major decisions in the Department's significant files. Implemented early	Team Leads actively supervise and review files assigned to lawyers under supervision. This includes a requirement for ongoing periodic reporting. Finally, the Legal Services Request (LSR) process implemented in 2020 (which must be followed by all departments to request legal services) provides a base level of tracking of requests and assignments. As part of a process of continuous improvement further opportunities will be explored once an Enterprise Content Management System is implemented in Legal Services, targeted for 2021.
----------	--	--

Legal Services Department Audit, 2018

<p>7</p>	<p>The Legal Services Department should develop a system to compile the information necessary to perform a workload analysis. This should include both volume output metrics that cover all areas of service delivery as well as staff hours incurred, including overtime. Management should also ensure the level of detail for direct hours includes all hours expended on specific files and sub-categorized into relevant types of duties.</p> <p>Implemented early</p>	<p>Recommendation completed to the extent possible with current systems and technology. Workload analysis completed based on 2020 activity. This includes implementation of system to intake and track files (Legal Services Requests or LSR) as well as tracking of overtime hours. Improvements to work load analysis will be ongoing and will be aided by Enterprise Content Management system targeted for implementation in 2021</p>
-----------------	---	---

Recommendation numbers in Progress –2021 Quarter 1

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress				
				2021 Qtr 2	2021 Qtr 3	2021 Qtr 4	2022 Qtr 1	2022 Qtr 2 & beyond
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	-	-	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11			8, 9,10,11		1, 2,3, 4, 5, 6, 7
ContinuousMonitoring- AdvisoryReportApril2020	-	-	1			1		
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations- July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.7, 1.8, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 3.1 ,4.1, 4.2,5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.9*		1.9*			
Legal Services Department Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3,4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9	-						
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	-	2**	2				
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11,12, 13, 18, 21, 23, 25, 26,27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 36	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34	2, 14, 15, 20, 22, 31, 33, 35,	22,31,35	2, 14, 15 20, 33			
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	8, 9, 10, 12, 14,	8,9,10, 12,14				
TOTAL (106)	69	10	27	9	6	5	-	7
1.9* is under review by Legal Services 2** is under review by Legal Services								



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report
2021 – Quarter 2

For more information visit: [Winnipeg.ca/audit](https://www.winnipeg.ca/audit)

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report- 2021 Quarter 2- Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

July 2021: Quarterly Report on the Implementation of Audit Recommendations for the period ending June 30, 2021

This report summarizes the status of:

- the number of recommendations implemented to date
- the number of recommendations that will not be implemented
- implementation of recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion

Summary of Audit Recommendations

Report	Number of Recommendations				
	Total	Implemented	In Progress	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
New report this quarter: BusinessImprovementZoneGovernanceReview 2021	1		1		0%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	-	11	-	0%
ContinuousMonitoring-AdvisoryReportApril2020	1	-	1	-	0%
New report this quarter: ContractVendorManagementAudit2020	9	1	8		11%
Final report: Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	22	18 *1 recommendation implementation to be confirmed 2021 Qtr 3	0	4	100%
Final report: Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	12			100%
Final report: Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	30 *8 recommendation implementations to be confirmed 2021 Qtr	0	6	100%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	10	5		67%
TOTAL	107	71	26	10	76%

* Implementation of audit recommendations that will be confirmed by the City Auditor in 2021 Qtr 3 are noted on the comments below.

Recommendations implemented in 2021 Qtr 2

ContractVendorManagementAudit2020		
1	We recommend that the Chief Administrative Officer designate a corporate group for oversight of contract management of goods and/or services contracts.	Corporate Finance, Materials Management Division acknowledges their role in the implementation of the Recommendations and are actively working on them.

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019		
1.9	The terms and conditions template provided by Legal Services for use in these Transactions should be reviewed with Management to ensure the objectives of the RETMF are met, and to ensure the corresponding evidence required is retained within file documentation.	<p>Legal will be incorporating the following wording into their Terms and Conditions template "The Lessee shall not affect the Leased Premises in any undesirable environmental manner. If the Lessee causes the Leased Premises to become contaminated, as determined by the City, the City may require the Lessee to immediately restore the land to its original condition. The City shall not be responsible for contamination caused by the Lessee and the Lessee shall indemnify the City from and against same."</p> <p>City Auditor to confirm updated Terms and Conditions in 2021 Qtr 3.</p>

[Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013](#)

1	We recommend that the Manager of Real Estate and the Superintendent of Property Management work with the Director of PP&D to prepare report for the consideration of Council that clarifies the applicability of criterion 6 and clarifies the language in the “Policy on the Sale/Lease of city Lands to Non- Profit Organizations.	This report was presented at the Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development on July 6, 2021. The Standing Policy Committee on Property and Development, Heritage and Downtown Development laid the matter over to its meeting on September 14, 2021.
---	--	--

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

2	Add a bottom visibility/object check to the end of day procedures for all outdoor pools, and ensure that these checks are conducted and logged on a daily basis. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132-97, Section 17 {1})	The Closing Lifeguard check list was updated to include ‘check bottom of pool’. To be confirmed by the Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
---	--	--

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

14	Ensure that all outdoor pools have a 150mm black disk on a white background permanently affixed at the deepest point in the pool. (Manitoba Regulation P210-132/97, Section 17 {1}).	Completed. To be confirmed by the Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

15	Ensure that all skimmers/lids are secured so that the skimmers cannot be accessed by patrons. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132-97, Section 8 {2})	Completed. To be confirmed by the Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

20	Outline all main drains/outlets in outdoor pools with a band of contrasting colour.	Completed. To be confirmed by the Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

22	Install an eyewash station in the Filter Room, mount in a location where it is accessible and can function properly and ensure eyewash bottle and/or solution is present. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 6.1 – 6.5, Section 21)	Eyewash bottles will be stored on a clearly labeled shelf at Freight House Pool. To be confirmed by the Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

31	Review the storage of pool chemicals on site. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 35.2)	Completed. To be confirmed by Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

33	Review safety measures for the metal covers/plates located on the edge of the wading pool and the surrounding apron. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 8 (2)).	Will be completed for various pool openings. To be confirmed by Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

35	Ensure that the ledge in the deep end of the pool is painted or outlined in a different colour.	Completed. To be confirmed by Auditor during site visits 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

Recommendation numbers in Progress –2021 Quarter 2

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress			
				2021 Qtr 3	2021 Qtr 4	2022 Qtr 1	2022 Qtr 2 & beyond
New report this quarter BusinessImprovementZoneGovernanceReview2021			1		1		
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018			1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11				1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11
ContinuousMonitoring-AdvisoryReportApril2020			1		1		
New report this quarter ContractVendorManagementAudit2020	1		2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8,9				2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8,9
Final report Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.7, 1.8, 1.9, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 3.1 4.1, 4.2,5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2					
Final report: Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12						
Final report: Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11,12, 13, 14,15,18,20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26,27, 28, 29, 30, 31,32,33, 35, 36	6, 16 ,17, 19, 24, 34					
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	8, 9, 10, 12, 14,	8,9,10 12,14			
TOTAL	71	10	26	5	2		19



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report
2021 – Quarter 3

For more information visit: [Winnipeg.ca/audit](https://www.winnipeg.ca/audit)

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report- 2021 Quarter 3 - Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

November 2021: Quarterly Report on the Implementation of Audit Recommendations for the period ending September 30, 2021

This report summarizes the status of:

- the number of recommendations implemented to date
- the number of recommendations that will not be implemented
- implementation of recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion

Summary of Audit Recommendations at September 30, 2021

Report	Number of Recommendations				
	Total	Implemented	In Progress	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
BusinessImprovementZoneGovernanceReview2021	1		1		0%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11	-	11	-	0%
Final Report ContinuousMonitoring-AdvisoryReportApril2020	1	1	-	-	100%
ContractVendorManagementAudit2020	9	1	8		11%
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	22	17	1	4	95%
Final report: Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	29	0	7	100%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	10	5		67%
TOTAL	95	58	26	11	75%

Recommendations implemented and confirmed in 2021 Qtr 3

[ContinuousMonitoring-AdvisoryReportApril2020](#)

1	We recommend that the Chief Financial Officer develop and implement a system of continuous monitoring of overtime and standby pay.	The Corporate Finance Department has received response -overtime and standby pay expenses report are accurate and appropriately approved. This information has also been shared with Human resources to review for opportunities to manage. The Corporate Finance Department will run this report annually and supply to department and Human resources for their review.
---	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

2	Add a bottom visibility/object check to the end of day procedures for all outdoor pools, and ensure that these checks are conducted and logged on a daily basis. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132-97, Section 17 {1})	Audit confirmed that management has developed the required policy/procedure. Upon site inspection, the Auditor was unable to confirm employee compliance. Management advises that they will address the performance issues of non-compliance. The Audit Department requested that Management monitor employee compliance and take appropriate action as required
---	--	--

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

14	Ensure that all outdoor pools have a 150mm black disk on a white background permanently affixed at the deepest point in the pool. (Manitoba Regulation P210-132/97, Section 17 {1}).	During the Auditor site visits in 2021 Qtr 3, it is was found that the 150mm black disk is permanently affixed at the deepest point of all pools however 6 pools - Freight House, Fort Garry, Kildonan Park, Transcona, Westdale, Windsor Park did not have a white background. The pool tanks are light blue in colour purposefully to reduce glare to enable Lifeguards better vision. After inspection by a Provincial Public Health Inspector, these pools are issued operating permits by Manitoba Public Health on an annual basis. Recommendation not to be implemented.
----	--	--

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

15	Ensure that all skimmers/lids are secured so that the skimmers cannot be accessed by patrons. (Manitoba Regulation P210 – 132-97, Section 8 {2})	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visits in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

20	Outline all main drains/outlets in outdoor pools with a band of contrasting colour.	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visits in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

22	Install an eyewash station in the Filter Room, mount in a location where it is accessible and can function properly and ensure eyewash bottle and/or solution is present. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 6.1 – 6.5, Section 21)	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visit in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	--

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

31	Review the storage of pool chemicals on site. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 35.2)	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visits in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	--	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

33	Review safety measures for the metal covers/plates located on the edge of the wading pool and the surrounding apron. (Manitoba Regulation W210 – 217/2006, Section 8 (2)).	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visits in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

[Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018](#)

35	Ensure that the ledge in the deep end of the pool is painted or outlined in a different colour.	Implementation confirmed by the Auditor during site visits in 2021 Qtr 3.
----	---	---

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2021 Quarter 3:

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 3	Revised implementation date
<u>Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019</u>	1.9	2021 Qtr 4
<u>William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018</u>	8	2021 Qtr 4
<u>William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018</u>	9	2021 Qtr 4
<u>William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018</u>	10	2021 Qtr 4
<u>William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018</u>	12	2021 Qtr 4
<u>William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018</u>	14	2021 Qtr 4

Recommendation numbers in Progress – 2021 Quarter 3

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers implemented	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Recommendation numbers in Progress	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress			
				2021 Qtr 4	2022 Qtr 1	2022 Qtr 2	2022 Qtr 3 & beyond
BusinessImprovementZoneGovernanceReview 2021			1	1			
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018			1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11				1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11
ContractVendorManagementAudit2020	1		2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9			2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9	
Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	1.1, 1.2, 1.4, 1.5, 1.7, 1.8, 1.9, 1.10, 1.11, 2.1, 2.3, 3.1 4.1, 4.2,5.1, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5	1.3, 1.6, 2.2, 5.2	1.9	1.9			
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	-	8, 9, 10, 12, 14,	8,9,10 12,14			
TOTAL	29	4	26	7		8	11



City of Winnipeg – Audit Department

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report
2021 – Quarter 4

For more information visit: [Winnipeg.ca/audit](https://www.winnipeg.ca/audit)

Implementation of Audit Recommendations Report- 2021 Quarter 4 - Summary

Audit Recommendations

Once an Audit is complete, the next step is implementation of the recommendations. The Audit Department provides a list of the audit recommendations to the Public Service Director of the department that was audited. The Public Service prepares an action plan and target for completion date. The implementation of the audit recommendations is the responsibility of the Public Service.

The Public Service provides status updates quarterly for all recommendations. For recommendations in progress this includes a target completion date. Documentation supporting implementation and progress is reviewed by the Audit Department for confirmation. If the Public Service indicates that a recommendation will not be implemented, residual risk is identified and discussed with the Department and reported to Audit Committee.

After presentation to the Audit Committee these are posted at: [Audit Quarterly Reports](#)

February 2022: Quarterly Report on the Implementation of Audit Recommendations for the period ending December 31, 2021

This report summarizes the status of:

- the number of recommendations implemented to date
- the number of recommendations that will not be implemented
- implementation of recommendations currently in progress and the target date for completion

Summary of the Implementation of Audit Recommendations at December 31, 2021

Open Audit Report	Number of Recommendations				
	Total	Implemented	In Progress	Not to be Implemented	Percent Complete
New report: Automatic Vehicle Locator Investigation-June21	6	1	5		17%
New report: Board Of Revision Audit - June 2021	18	1	17		5%
Business Improvement Zone Governance Review 2021	1		1		0%
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018	11		11		0%
ContractVendorManagementAudit2020	9	1	8		11%
Final Report: Independent Fairness Commissioner- Summary Report Recommendations-July2019	22	18	0	4	100%
New report Municipal Cemeteries Investigation June 2021	7	6	1		85%
William R. Clement Parkway/Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	15	10	5		66%
TOTAL Recommendations in open reports	89	37	48	4	
Final reports were issued in 2021 for the following reports that were closed in 2021					
ContinuousMonitoring-AdvisoryReportApril2020	1	1			100%
Safety Review of the City of Winnipeg Outdoor Aquatic Facilities Audit, 2018	36	30		6	100%
NewFireParamedicStationsConstructionProject,2013	14	13		1	100%
WinnipegPoliceServiceHeadquartersConstructionProject2014	19	19			100%
Non-Monetary Real Estate Grants Audit, 2013	12	12			100%

Recommendations implemented and confirmed in 2021 Qtr 4

Documentation supporting the implementation was reviewed and confirmed by the City Auditor.

Independent Fairness Commissioner-Summary Report Recommendations-July2019		
1.9	The terms and conditions template provided by Legal Services for use in these Transactions should be reviewed with Management to ensure the objectives of the RETMF are met, and to ensure the corresponding evidence required is retained within file documentation.	Legal Services updated the terms and condition template – the updated template was reviewed by the IFC and PP&D and subsequently implemented by PP& D.

Municipal Cemeteries Investigation June 2021		
2.	We recommend that the Branch work with PP&D Human Resources to ensure all job descriptions are updated as required. The updates should be communicated with staff so they are aware of their current roles and responsibilities.	All job descriptions are up to date and in line with the current duties and responsibilities for all positions.
3	We recommend that the Branch evaluate the current organization structure and job descriptions to ensure proper oversight is provided to all office staff.	The Cemeteries Administrator has implemented an oversight strategy for office staff to ensure accuracy of work and identify potential issues.

4.	We recommend that the Branch work with PP&D Human Resources to ensure a process is implemented so that annual performance reviews are completed for all staff.	A process is in place so that annual performance reviews will be completed for all staff.
5.	We recommend the Branch work with PP&D Human Resources to ensure a process is implemented to communicate all safety concerns to the direct supervisor in written form.	Working with the PPD Safety Officer a process has been implemented that all safety concerns will be documented in writing. All conversations between the Safety Officer and Cemeteries supervisors will be documented in a follow up email.
6.	We recommend that the Branch develop a process to track the amount of time spent entering information into the system, and to evaluate the opportunity to dedicate existing resources to enter the remaining information into the system during the off-season with specific data entry targets.	The Cemeteries Branch began entering information for Brookside Cemetery into Stone Orchard in June 2021. In December 2021, the Branch began entering information for Section D10 and tracked the amount of time that was is being taken to enter information. Based on this effort, it has been estimated that it will take approximately 13 years to complete the entering of Brookside information. The Branch has also set targets and is tracking progress against said targets. There are no immediate plans to dedicate existing resources to this task as there is no spare capacity within the Branch.
7.	We recommend that the Branch develop a plan to fully implement Stone Orchard. This could include evaluating opportunities for seasonal, part-time, or temporary staff to support system data entry.	A plan is in place to complete data entry for Brookside Cemetery, which would then allow the Branch to fully utilize Stone Orchard. Brookside Cemetery was activated in Stone Orchard in June 2021. To date, 27 sections have been entered and are fully operational. As data is prepared and completed for other sections, it will be added to Stone Orchard. This process is expected to take approximately 13 years with current resources. There is currently no budget for additional resources to assist with this task though the Branch remains open to opportunities to expedite this process should resources become available to assist with this work.

Recommendations Targeted for Completion in 2021 Quarter 4:

Implementation dates are revised by the public service for a variety of reasons. Delays can be attributed to external factors such as the pandemic and conflicting priorities. Explanations for the delays are reviewed by the City Auditor to confirm that they are reasonable.

Audit Report	Recommendation # Targeted for Completion in Quarter 4	Revised implementation date
BusinessImprovementZoneGovernanceReview 2021	1	2022 Qtr 1
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	8	2022 Qtr 1
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	9	2022 Qtr 1
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	10	2022 Qtr 1
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	12	2022 Qtr 1
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	14	2022 Qtr 1

Recommendation numbers in Progress – 2021 Quarter 4

Implementation status updates were provided by management and were reviewed by the City Auditor.

Audit Report	Recommendation numbers already implemented	Recommendation numbers in progress	Recommendation numbers not to be implemented	Target dates for implementation of recommendations in progress			
				2022 Qtr 1	2022 Qtr 2	2022 Qtr 3	2022 Qtr 4 & beyond
New report: Automatic Vehicle Locator Investigation-June 2021	1	2, 3, 4, 5, 6		2, 3	4, 5		6
New report: Board Of Revision Audit - June 2021	7	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,16,17,18		1,2,3,4,5,6,16	7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,17,18		
Business Improvement Zone Governance Review 2021		1		1			
By-Law Amalgamation Audit, 2018		1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11					1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11
New report Municipal Cemeteries Investigation – June 2021	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7	1		1			
Contract Vendor Management Audit 2020	1	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9			2	3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9	7
William R. Clement Parkway / Sterling Lyon Parkway Extension Project Audit, 2018	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 15	8, 9, 10, 12, 14,		8,9,10,12,14			
TOTAL	19	49		16	14	6	13